FINAL REPORT

Technical Assistance- Awareness and Prevention on HIV/AIDS and Human Trafficking
TA-4364: MON

October 2009
CONTENT

1. Executive summary
2. Background
   2.1 Why the project started
   2.2 Regional Road Development Project
   2.3 Goal and Objectives
   2.4 Project Implementation Sites: Dornogovi and Govisumber Aimags
3. Project Structure
   3.1 Central and Local Steering Committees
   3.2 Project team
4. Implementation Strategy
5. Project Interventions
   5.1 Component 1: Advocacy
   5.2 Component 2: Behavior Change Communication
   5.3 Component 3: Comprehensive medical package
   5.4 Component 4: Border control and police capacity building to prevent human trafficking
   5.5 Component 5: Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation
6. Project Outcomes
   6.1 Findings of the evaluation survey
   6.2 Achievements of DMF targets
7. Sustainability
8. Cost Effectiveness and Coordination
9. Lessons Learnt (knowledge product)
10. Recommendations
11. Conclusion
12. Annexes
   a. List of Developed Materials
   b. Communication Strategy
   c. Situation Analysis on Human Trafficking
   d. Final Report on Human Trafficking
1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

ADB supported project “Technical Assistance on Awareness and Prevention of HIV/AIDS and Human Trafficking” was implemented in Dornogovi and Govisumber aimags from January 2006 to October 2009, with the funds of 350,000 USD. The project was executed by Health Sector Development Project-2 (Loan-1998), implemented by Ministry of Health, Mongolia.

This TA is included under Loan 2087-MON: Regional Road Development Project, which develops the remaining section of Mongolia’s north-south road transport corridor between Choir and the border with the People’s Republic of China (PRC) in Zamiin-Uud. The corridor will link the Asian highway networks of the PRC and the Russian Federation and passes through major economic centers of Mongolia.

Goal of the TA was to reduce the transmission of STI/HIV/AIDS and prevent human trafficking alongside the road construction. It had 5 components: Advocacy, Support for in-depth behavior change, Comprehensive medical package, Border control and police capacity building on human trafficking prevention and Monitoring and evaluation.

The TA worked on HIV/AIDS and human trafficking prevention through awareness raising; condom use promotion; peer education with vulnerable populations, such as construction workers, sex workers and local communities; staff capacity building including trainings of STI/HIV related health service providers, trainings of police and border officials on human trafficking prevention and provision of basic equipments, STI drugs and testing kits. The project has addressed and brought together two broad issues such as HIV/AIDS and human trafficking prevention which certainly made it unique and innovative in comparison with other related projects implemented in health sector of Mongolia; played a role of facilitator between health, police and border control office in terms of prevention of HIV/AIDS and human trafficking and thus has a valuable importance in expansion of cooperation between above mentioned agencies.

Baseline and evaluation studies were held to evaluate project outcome. Evaluation team considered that this project has been implemented at a satisfactory level.

According to evaluation, following positive changes happened in TA sites:

- consistently high knowledge of target population on prevention of STIs/HIV/AIDS;
- tendency for reduction of casual sex;
- increase in condom use, particularly constant use of condom; and
- raised percentage of people voluntarily involved in counseling and testing;

Establishment of VCT center together with provision of the required equipments, STI drugs and HIV and STI tests, IEC materials as well as the training of the human recourses contributed to the improvements in quality and access to STIs/HIV/AIDS services.

Positive attitude and commitment from senior officers of local administration, Border Control office and Police Authorities in target aimags showed that project has been implemented successfully. As a result of this project, knowledge of target population on prevention of human trafficking was increased; positive attitude of avoiding risky situations and ability to take immediate actions in cases of affecting increased and capacity of local authorities to tackle these issues was improved.
Key recommendations included:

**General recommendations**

1. HIV/AIDS and human trafficking prevention project needs to be continued, taking into consideration that human trafficking is one of factors for increasing the risk of HIV/AIDS transmission.
2. The support from local authorities needs to be strengthened in order to ensure the project sustainability.

**Recommendations on HIV/AIDS Prevention**

1. To continue discussion with Department of Road and Ministry of Road Transportation and Urban Development on necessity of HIV prevention in the construction field, capacity building of relevant institutions and inclusion of HIV issues in the relevant regulations
2. To create mechanism for routine collaboration of relevant officials of Department of Road and health people (MOH, Department of Health, NCCD)
3. To set peer education technique as one of the most effective approach for working with infrastructure projects.
4. To create a monitoring and evaluation system, suitable for HIV projects, working in connection with infrastructure projects and incorporated into overall monitoring system in the country.

**Recommendations on Human Trafficking Prevention**

1. Development of a strategic framework to address trafficking in Mongolia based on the National Plan of Action, but with clear prioritisation of activities and mechanisms to measure impact.
2. Assisting the Mongolian government and other actors to identify and access high quality specialist anti-trafficking expertise as required.
3. Facilitation of cooperation between Mongolia and China on a range of levels.
4. Strengthening of the legal framework around trafficking.
5. Continuation of basic training on trafficking for front-line officials (police, border guards).
6. Start training for prosecutors and judges, which will contribute to strengthening cooperation on law enforcement/prosecution between all concerned parties in Mongolia.
7. Continuation and expansion of existing programmes to increase awareness and understanding of trafficking and related issues, particularly using interactive techniques such as peer education.
8. The investigation on possibility for inclusion of complex subject on human trafficking in curriculum of secondary schools, professional and vocational training centers.

We conclude that:

- Projects of this kind could be very effective way of expanding HIV prevention work into infrastructure sector. Sensitization of policy makers in infrastructure field in HIV prevention work could be beneficial by including necessary changes in the infrastructure related policy documents.
- The Project offered a rare opportunity to combine trafficking prevention activities with HIV/AIDS prevention activities, due to the fact that the target groups for these activities inevitably overlap. Moreover, it provided the opportunity to explore the use of peer education techniques as an overlooked strategy in the fight against trafficking.
An integrated approach is crucial: awareness raising, followed by well planned and effective approach on behavior change, community mobilization and on the other hand, qualified and accessible health service.

Capacity building and involvement of existing structures is important to ensure sustainability of the project activities. Collaboration of Health authorities with aimag administration and other relevant sectors, like police, infrastructure could be beneficial for organizing effective interventions at the local level.

2. BACKGROUND

2.1. Why the project started

Mongolia is one of the very low HIV/AIDS prevalence countries (<0.1%) with only 58 registered HIV positive cases by September 2009 transmitted mainly through sexual contact. However, the country is vulnerable to HIV/AIDS due to existence of high-risk behavior among young population, increasing number of commercial sex with poor condom use, and high prevalence of STIs\(^1\). With a relatively young population, high poverty incidence, and low status, women are particularly vulnerable to STI/HIV/AIDS and human trafficking.

 Trafficking is a relatively recent phenomenon in Mongolia and new information was emerging all the time. Systematic trafficking cases have been reported.\(^2\) 27 cases with more than 200 Mongolian victims were identified by 2007. But this was likely to be the ‘tip of the iceberg’ and no reliable estimates were available on the size of the problem. However, all relevant government officials and NGOs, working on human right expressed the view that the problem was considerably greater than had previously been understood. New trafficking patterns appeared to be emerging on a disconcertingly regular basis.

2.2. Regional Road Development Project (RRDP)

Regional Road Development Project is one of the biggest projects implemented in the road sector in Mongolia, which is responsible for construction of 432 km road from Choir to Zamiin-Uud and financed by Asian Development Bank, Government of Korea and Mongolian Government. This road is a main vertical road of Mongolia which is a part of AH-3 link of Asian Highway Network in Mongolia. By implementing this project, AH-3 link in Mongolia will be connected with complete paved road. The Mongolia has received loans from Asian Development Bank and Economic Development Cooperation Fund of Korea for financing 432 km road construction of Choir-Sainshand-Zamiin Uud road under Regional Road Development Project MON-2087.

In developing the RRDP, it was recognised that the construction of the road, while bringing many positive benefits may also have potential negative impacts to the local communities.

Therefore, as well as the road building itself, the RRDP included:

1. A cross-border transport facilitation plan;
2. Road safety improvement;
3. Area development to maximise the poverty reduction impact of the Project; and

---

\(^1\) In 2005 STI was 47.4% of all communicable diseases

\(^2\) An attempt of trafficking over 400 Mongolian girls was reported in the UB Post on 30 January 2004.
TA-4364 was aimed to mitigate the spread of HIV/AIDS and other STIs, as well as exposing an increased number of people to the risks of human trafficking through a series of interrelated activities involving awareness raising; peer education with vulnerable populations; and strengthening border control and police capacity against human trafficking. The Project offered a rare opportunity to combine trafficking prevention activities with HIV/AIDS prevention activities, due to the fact that the target groups for these activities inevitably overlap.

Implementation progress of RRDP as of June, 2009:

“Intercontinental Consultants and Technocrats Pvt” Company from India was selected as Construction Supervision Consultant and provides consulting service. Road has been divided into 4 packages: Package A, Package B1, Package NP 1, Package NP2 and 2 more additional roads build for Erdene and Urgun soum within the Area Development Component: AR1 and AR2, respectively. So far 3 contractors were selected for packages A, B1, NP1 and AR2. Road construction progress is indicated below as of June, 2009.

**Package A:** 176.4 km from Choir to 35th Railway Crossing. The contractor is “Hanshin Engineering and Construction Company” of Korea. Contractor has been claimed for terminating the Contract due to the financial and taxation problems in August 2008. Implementation progress is 8%. In 2008 there were more than 500 workers on this section.

**Package B1:** 126.7 km from 35th Railway Crossing to 18th Khudag plus 4.5 km in Sainshand town. The contractor is “China Geo-Engineering Corporation” company of P.R.C. By end 2008 total work progress was 53.31%, Contractor claimed for Price inflation for works done in 2007-2008 and noticed impossibility to continue the construction works if the claim is not given. Therefore, main construction work is not commenced in 2009 and at the end of Quarter II 2009 has only 1% progress. In 2008 there were around 500 workers, in 2009 only 100 workers.

**Package NP1 & AR2:** 62.2 km from 18th Khudag forward. The contractor is “Shengli Engineering & Construction company” of P. R.C. The road work of 2009 is started from May 2009, and work progress is 7.33% by June, 2009. In terms of AR2 (18.3 km to Urgun soum) Contractor commenced the road works of 2009 from May and progress is 34.24% by June, 2009. There were around 190 workers mobilized.

**Package NP2 and AR1:** 61.8 km from end of previous road package to Zamiin-Uud. These packages are delayed due to the financing problems.

Additional financing sources to continue road construction in above sections and start construction work in last 2 sections are expected from ADB and MCC.

### 2.3. Goal and Objectives

Goal of the TA was to reduce the transmission of STI/HIV/AIDS and prevent human trafficking alongside the road construction.

Objectives:

- Raise public awareness of HIV/AIDS and human trafficking
- Address the risk of HIV/AIDS transmission among construction workers, sex workers, local communities and road users
- Strengthen border control and police capacity against human trafficking
Strategies were:

- Creating awareness
- Promotion of behavior change
- Promotion of condom use
- Improvement of STI/HIV/AIDS services
- Improving police and border office capacity for human trafficking prevention
- Monitoring

Components:

- Advocacy
- Support for in-depth behavior change
- Comprehensive medical package
- Border control and police capacity building on human trafficking prevention
- Monitoring and evaluation

2.4. Project Implementation Sites- Dornogovi and Govisumber Aimag

**Dornogovi aimag**

Dornogovi has population of 54023 by 2006 with 14786 households, spread in territory of 109400 sq.km. Aimag has 14 soums and aimag center is Sainshand with 19548 population by 2006. The biggest soum of Dornogovi aimag is Zamiin-uud with population size 9665.

Mongolia has only one route of the railway, which passed through the country from north to south. Dornogovi is one the few aimags, which has railway connection to Ulaanbaatar and to PRC to other end. With this aspect it has biggest border port in Mongolia- Zamiin-Uud, which works constantly throughout the year and has about 5000 persons passing the border in one day. In Dornogovi, 54.8% of all population resides along the railway (the railway have almost same route as the road, going to be build by RRDP).

The main income comes from agriculture- mostly herding sector, livestock industry. Aimag has around 825.0 thousand livestock by 2009. But there are still many challenges related to difficult weather conditions like desertification, often natural disasters and water degradation.

Aimag has total number of 73 mineral deposits of 34 types of ores like fluorite spar, copper, oil, energy coal, nonferrous metal etc. Around 250 places were determined with different types of ores and more than 180 organizations hold survey license or exploration mining license.

**Govisumber aimag**

Govisumber has 13048 thousand population, 3440 households. It has territory of 5.5 thousand square km. Aimag has 6685 temporary residents, which is one of the main barriers of providing accessible and quality health service. In addition to that health organizations of the province offers health service to own citizens and the population of neighboring soums of Dornogovi, Tuv, Khentii, Dundgovi aimags.

Govisumber also has railway connection to Ulaanbaatar and to PRC, but located closer to Ulaanbaatar (250 km).
The main income also comes from agriculture (mostly herding sector, livestock industry). Aimag has 6 fluorite spar mines (unofficial), which employs around 300 people. Generally there are over 30 deposits of mineral resources and findings within 100 km radius from the center of the province.

It includes: fluorite spar /38 million ton/, mixed metal /1.1 million ton/, iron ore /13 million ton/, graphite /200 thousand ton/ and brown coal /13 billion ton/.

The province has Shiveegovi coal mine, listed among the biggest mines at the national level. It has reserve of 300 years if exploits 2000 tons of coal a year.

3. PROJECT STRUCTURE

Structurally, TA-4364 is located under the Health Sector Development Project II (HSDP-2), but not under the Regional Road Development Project. This structure has pros and cons in terms of project management. Due to the close relation with MOH it has been easy to cooperate with other health, particularly STI/HIV/AIDS programs and projects. This cooperation was essential, particularly in terms of STI/HIV related service issues. TA was able to perfectly fit into national policy and nationwide efforts to strengthen HIV service throughout the country and contributed to improvement of HIV/STI services at the TA sites. But at the same time it demanded additional effort from TA Coordinator to cooperate with Road Project, Department of Road (DOR) and former Ministry of Road, Transportation and Tourism (MRTT).

Below is the Management structure of the TA:
3.1. Central and Local Steering Committees

Central Steering Committee was established on April 28, 2006. Due to the combined topics of HIV/AIDS and human trafficking prevention, members of the Committee represented different ministries and other important stakeholders:

Chair : Vice Minister of Health
Secretary: TA Coordinator

Members:
1. Head of Health Policy Development Department
2. Deputy head of Population Development Policy Coordination Department, Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour
3. Head of the Information, Monitoring and Evaluation Department, Ministry of Justice and Internal Affairs
4. Deputy Head of Counselor Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
5. Head of Department of Road, Ministry of Road, Transportation and Tourism
6. Project Manager, Regional Road Development Project, Ministry of Road, Transportation and Tourism
7. Governor, Govisumber aimag
8. Vise Governor, Dornogovi aimag
9. Vise director, National Center for Health Development
10. Project Coordinator, HIV/AIDS and TB project, Global Fund
11. Executive Director, Health Sector Development Project -2, Ministry of Health

Members of Steering committee in Govisumber aimag

Chair : J. Bayanmunkh, Governor, Govisumber aimag
Secretary: L. Tuvshinzaya, Head of Health Department

Members:
1. D. Zandarya, Head of Government Policy and Justice Department, Governor’s Office
2. L. Uranchimeg, Head of Education and Culture Department, Governor’s Office
3. G. Amarsaikhan, Head of the Railway Agency
4. D. Battsetseg, Head of the Social Welfare Department, Governor’s Office
5. Ch. Ganbold, Head of Police Department
6. D. Bayasgalan, Governor of Shiveegovi soum
7. D. Dorjpurev, National Inspector in charge of road and transportation control, Governor’s Office

Members of Steering committee in Dornogovi aimag

Chair : Ts. Ganbaatar, Vice Governor, Dornogovi aimag
Secretary: Ch.Tsetsegmaa, Officer in charge of health, Social Policy Coordination Department, Governor’s Office

Members:
1. Yu. Batdelger, Chief, Police Agency, Dornogovi aimag
2. E. Dashtsoo, Governor, Zamyn-Uud soum
3. D. Battsengel, Head of the Border Control Office in Zamyn-Uud soum
4. G. Enkhtsetseg, Head of Health Department, Dornogovi aimag
5. R. Purevdagva, Transportation Coordination department, Governor's office
6. D. Tseren, Head of Justice Department, Governor's office
7. E. Shoovdor, Head of Intelligence Agency, Dornogovi aimag

3.2. Project Team

Central Team

Central team comprised from following consultants:

- TA Coordinator 46 person/month
- International Consultant on Human Trafficking Prevention 2 person/month
- 2 local consultants 10 person/month together: Management Specialist on Anti-Human Trafficking and Training Specialist on Anti-Human Trafficking.

Local Teams

Team 1. Choir (Govisumber)

1. Aimag Coordinator (Head of Aimag Health Department, MOH); In charge of HIV/AIDS and overall coordination and monitoring
2. Anti-Human trafficking Specialist (Head of Aimag Justice Office); In charge of anti-human trafficking
3. Health Education Specialist/Field Support Officer; In charge of Peer Education (CSW, Community, School, Construction workers)

Aimag Team 2. (6 people) Sainshand (Dornogovi)

1. Aimag Coordinator (Head of Aimag Health Department, MOH); In charge of HIV/AIDS and overall coordination and monitoring
2. Anti-Human trafficking Specialist (Deputy Head of Aimag Police Department); In charge of anti-human trafficking
3. Health Education Specialist/Field Support Officer; In charge of Peer Education (CSW, Community, School, Construction workers)

Aimag TA Team Sub-team (at Zamiin-Uud) (3 people) Zamiin-Uud (Dornogovi)

1. Soum Coordinator (Head of Zamyn-Uud Soum Hospital) Sub-team leader; In charge of STI/VCT in Zamyn-Uud, and peer education for mobile population (CSW) in Erlian City, PRC
2. Anti-Human Tracking Specialist (Border Control Office or Police office); In charge of anti-human trafficking
3. Health Education Specialist Field Support Officer; In charge of Peer Education (CSW, Community, School, Construction workers)

4. IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY

Although both HIV/AIDS and, in particular, human trafficking issues were comparatively new to Mongolia, it was clear that, as elsewhere they will require long-term responses. On the
other hand, as a Project attached specifically to the building of a new road, TA-4364 was a comparatively small and short-term project. Therefore, we considered that it's important not only to maximise the benefits generated by the Project but also to work to ensure that activities supported by the Project lead to sustainable impact after its conclusion.

In addition, both issues involved a wide range of organisations, both Government and non-Government, with anti-trafficking programmes in particular encompassing law enforcement, border control, support for victims, education, international cooperation, and so on. Experience from elsewhere revealed many examples of overlap and duplication between different agencies.

Coordination and cooperation with other agencies and projects working against HIV/AIDS and trafficking in Mongolia was not only important therefore in ensuring the sustainability of Project outcomes, but also in reducing the potential for duplication and overlap which could otherwise dilute the already limited level of resources with which to combat both these issues.

Therefore, the Project’s key strategies involved:

- Working within existing structures and mechanisms as much as possible;
- Working collaboratively with a range of government and non-government partners;
- Creating and nurturing linkages (locally and nationally) that will endure after Project completion;
- Emphasising capacity development through high quality training programmes, and
- Drawing on the latest in international experience and lessons learned.

In terms of HIV/AIDS, the project collaborated with the National Centre for Communicable Diseases (NCCD), the Health Promotion Department, National Centre for Health Development (NCHD), the Global Fund on HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Tuberculosis and the National AIDS Foundation, a local NGOs. This included mutual support of training activities, with the Project participating in several training activities run by partner organisations and vice versa.

The National Centre for Communicable Diseases was a particularly important partner and provided training of project counterparts on diagnosis and treatment of STIs as well as voluntary counselling and testing. The Global Fund assisted in providing condoms in project target areas, while a large international NGO, Marie Stopes International is assisted the Project with condom social marketing in Govisumber and Domogovi Province.

With regard to trafficking, Project’s strategy was close cooperation with other agencies. This was shown in the training programmes, which work closely with existing government structures, and in the materials development where the team was working close with both local NGOs and external donor agencies such as the project in Ministry of Social Welfare, supported by UNICEF. As well as the Ministry of Social Welfare and the other key anti-trafficking donor, The Asia Foundation, the Project also maintained ongoing contact with its two key counterpart agencies, the Mongolian Police and the Central Office for Border protection in the Ministry of Justice and Internal Affairs. The Project was also working to establish a linkage between the Mongolian Police and the Asia Regional Prevention of People Trafficking Project (ARCPPT), which works closely with most of the ASEAN countries on criminal justice response to trafficking and also provides training to the Australian Federal Police. This was hoped to provide the Police with ongoing access to up-to-date information on international good practice in combating trafficking, including the latest in training materials and techniques, and examples of successful efforts in cross-border cooperation. In addition, through the international anti-trafficking adviser, the Project was maintaining links...
with partners in other parts of the world, to ensure access to new information, experiences and lessons learned in combating trafficking.

Indeed, many of the activities planned by the Project overlapped with activities already planned by other agencies. While this provided some early complications and necessitated some modification of Project plans, it also highlighted that the proposed activities were in line with the Government’s top priorities on this issue. While a more cooperative and coordinated approach required a degree of flexibility with regard to project planning and implementation, it also offered opportunities for increased results, particularly in terms of sustainability of impact after Project activities are completed.

In terms of the Project’s work on Behaviour Change Communication, incorporating both HIV and trafficking, the Project is again worked through existing structures, supporting the formation of multi-disciplinary teams comprised of staff of key departments at aimag (provincial) level. These departments included the Governor’s Office, the Ministry of Health, the Police and the Border Guards. Unfortunately, there was no suitable NGO at the province level, which works on regular basis and has a capacity to implement the project activities.

Importantly, work towards reducing risky behaviour relating to trafficking, was drawn on two decades of experience in the HIV/AIDS sector. This highlighted that raising awareness activities in themselves are often insufficient to bring about positive behaviour change. Perhaps somewhat surprisingly, peer education techniques among vulnerable populations, widely used in the response to HIV/AIDS are almost unheard of with regard to trafficking prevention in many parts of the world. The Project therefore provided the opportunity to explore the use of these peer education techniques as an overlooked strategy in the fight against trafficking.

Following charts are showing main strategic framework of the project interventions:

Some constrains, which TA faced, heavily influenced to the workplan and required the TA to be more flexible in implementation.

Major constrain was timeline of the road construction. There were delays in starting construction work in general and this delay differed in each parts of the road. First Contractor’s work, for example, only commenced in April 2007. As a result, the key target groups for TA-4364 have not been present for a large part of the TA. In addition to that, in Mongolia, construction season is very short- only from May to October. Since both executing companies were Chinese at the time of TA implementation period, most of the workers were of Chinese nationality. Therefore companies loose certain time for the immigration issues with the Mongolian government and finally, most of the workers stayed for a certain period of time and workers tend change, due to the work type. Therefore it was difficult to assess the outcome of the TA implementation by baseline and evaluation studies.
So, basically road construction features influenced the TA implementation in two ways: (i) we had to change the type of the activity- due to the difficulty in allocating sufficient time for the full training course, some of the peer education trainings were transformed to short time lunch sessions, which was eventually very successful in involving almost all construction workers and involving peer educators/ workers as a resource persons for the sessions; (ii) it made difficult the process of evaluation, as it influenced to the timing of the surveys and to the sample size of construction workers.

5. PROJECT INTERVENTIONS

5.1 Component 1: Advocacy

This component was aimed to develop supporting environment for the project implementation, increase ownership of the relevant ministry and local government for the project. Advocacy activities were targeted to RRDP staff and relevant officers of the former Ministry of Road, Transportation and Tourism, the local government, local media, administration of the private and government organizations.

Regular informal advocacy meetings with stakeholders, Local Steering Committees were also crucial for project implementation and increasing support from their side.

5 official advocacy workshops were organized in Ulaanbaatar, Dornogovi and Govisumber aimags. RRDP staff, officers from Department of Road, local administration, media, relevant government officers and other stakeholders were involved in these workshops.

As a result of these advocacy activities, local administration showed support to the project implementation, bringing some financial support for organizing HIV/AIDS campaigns and later even becoming best functioning Aimag Subcommittees on HIV/AIDS.

5.2 Component 2: Behavior Change Communication

This component was the biggest component, which incorporated different strategies like peer education, awareness raising campaigns, special small scale campaigns for workplaces. Those strategies targeted local communities, local workplaces and construction sites.

Peer education program was targeted to main target groups- construction workers; adolescents (school and college students); communities, particularly unemployed youth; vulnerable women and/or sex workers.

Peer educators’ duty comprised from conducting trainings where possible (for example, at the worksites, schools, colleges), providing information on STI/HIV/AIDS prevention on the regular staff/student meetings, distributing IEC materials, volunteering during campaigns, and communication activities, providing mutual support and advice to the peers.

Handbook for Peer educators, with reading materials and specially designed training sessions was produced and distributed to trainees. Handbook, as well as trainings covered both HIV/AIDS and human trafficking topics. It consisted from 2 parts, 1st with reading materials about STI/HIV/AIDS and human trafficking (understanding human trafficking, situation in Mongolia, ways of prevention, useful tips for travelers abroad, links and addresses of NGOs and organizations, working on human trafficking), 2nd with training curriculum for peer educators, with session, designed in participatory manner aimed to enhance knowledge, develop skills and address stigma and discrimination in regards to HIV/AIDS and human trafficking.
Several motivation meetings were held amongst active peer educators from the community, like sport competitions, re-trainings with some recreational activities, selections and awards for best peer educators.

Special attention of the TA team was paid to the sex workers. At the initial stage, we identified a separate target group called "sex workers". But we realized that it was hard to find so called "sex workers" inside the roadside community. But according to local health workers, there were people, who were considered as having paid sex. Therefore, we decided to determine a target group called "vulnerable women" rather than "sex workers", including those who were heading households with no spouse or husband and in addition, who are poor or very poor. Considering the fact that sex workers are quite mobile in Mongolia in order to follow the profit, they usually move to different locations. We conducted some activities in Erlian, PRC, where we can find most constant and somehow organized communities of sex workers. 12 girls were trained as peer educators in Erlian and they worked as peer educators and among other sex workers. Since Erlian is located in China, it was difficult to provide testing, diagnosing and providing treatment to sex workers. Therefore, in the future it will be crucial to collaborate with Chinese NGOs. But there is a need to have a good understanding of the situations in Erlian.

In terms of condom availability, there was an already existing mechanism of condom social marketing, supported by Global Fund HIV/AIDS project and implemented by Marie Stopes Mongolia (NGO). Condoms were also sufficiently available in local drug stores, which are accessible financial (Global Fund condom social marketing project sells condoms for 100 MNT through drug stores).

A "100% Condom Use Project" (CUP) started in Dornogovi and Govisumber aimags, almost at the same time as the TA. Although this project performed initial meetings and provided small number of condoms to local entertainment places and hotels, the continuity of the 100% CUP was not sufficient. Taking into the consideration that provision of condoms to hotels and entertainment places already started, we provided trainings to the service officers of those places and afterwards continuously supported them with IEC materials. As a result, selling condoms at the hotel reception and entertainment places became stable.

Awareness raising campaigns were organized in Dornogovi and Govisumber aimag mainly during World AIDS DAYS (WAD) in 2006, 2007, 2008. These campaigns included street parades, knowledge competitions and small dramas, TV and radio commercials, photo exhibitions, distribution of IEC materials and condoms.

Small scale campaigns can be divided mainly into two types:

i. HIV/AIDS prevention lunch sessions at the road construction companies. This type of activity was chosen due to lack of time, construction companies could allocate for the trainings. Therefore, we trained first company leaders, mid level managers, peer leaders and translators from the construction companies, and they in turn became good source of resource persons during lunch time communication sessions. Considering the fact that most construction workers were Chinese nationality and there was a need for translation and understanding Chinese culture, managers’ and translators’ leadership as a peer educators was important.

ii. HIV/AIDS workplace program competition conducted among local public and private organizations. This was an efficient way of community mobilization, since local organizations conducted 1 month HIV/AIDS program at the workplace within their own resources. And at the end of the campaign all organizations had chance to come together to participate in the final meeting and share their experiences to each other.
Developed materials:

- Handbook for Introductory Training for Police and Border Control Officials on Human Trafficking Prevention
- Handbook for Peer Education Training on HIV/AIDS and Human Trafficking Prevention
- Situation Analysis on Human Trafficking Prevention in Mongolia

Table 1. Summary of activities, conducted within the Component 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>No of involved people</th>
<th>Involved places</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Types and numbers of printed and developed IEC materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Printed IEC materials, 9 types:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Posters 2 types</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Leaflets 5 types</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Playing cards 1 type</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notebook 1 type</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Documentary movie 2 types</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TV spots 5 types</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Radio spots 3 types</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Radio program 1 type</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TV programs 2 types</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No of printed copies:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>28000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>150</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4 channels</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3 channels</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 channel</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TV and radio programs and spots are broadcasted through national and local TV and radio channels</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Distributed in Ulaanbaatar (UB), Govisumber and Dornogovi aimags</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Trainings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Experience sharing and Study tours</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Yunnan province, PCR, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Advocacy workshops</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>UB, Govisumber, Dornogovi, Zamiin-Uud</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>TOTs, re-trainings of the trainers</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>UB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Peer education trainings</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>1485</td>
<td>Govisumber, Dornogovi, Zamiin-Uud</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Peer educators’ re-training</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>Govisumber, Dornogovi, Zamiin-Uud</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>f.</td>
<td>Communication activities and campaigns</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>19687</td>
<td>Govisumber, Dornogovi, Zamiin-Uud</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Communication activities (short training sessions, presentations and Q&amp;A sessions)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>20530</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.3 Component 3: Comprehensive medical package

This component was implemented successfully with the collaboration of similar projects and programs. At the time of the TA implementation, there were few other projects (Global Fund supported HIV/AIDS projects in the area of 100% CUP, Condom social marketing and
promoting of VCT; Red Cross project to work with CSW in Erlian, PRC), which where ongoing in the project sites. Therefore, in order to save limited resources and considering sustainability of the project, TA tried to coordinate with the existing project as much as possible.

At the same time, appointing a Head of Local Health Department as a local TA Coordinator, was very helpful in coordinating TA activities with ongoing 2 projects, indicated above.

As a result, this component had following areas of interventions.

Table 2. Areas of interventions and collaboration within Component 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Areas of intervention</th>
<th>Collaboration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provision of equipments-equipments, necessary for conducting trainings at the different site were provided to local health departments (laptops, LCD projectors and digital cameras)</td>
<td>Training facilities were provided by local government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishment of VCT center in Govisumber aimag</td>
<td>National VCT working group was established in 2007, TA Coordinator was included as a member. According to national work plan, VCT centers planned to be established in all aimag centers and some strategically important soums. There were 3 spots (Gavisumber, Sainshand and Zamiin-Uud), required to have VCT center in the project sites. There was an agreement between donor agencies to establish VCT centers at their areas. Due to luck of resources, TA established VCT center in Gavisumber. VCT center in Sainshand was established by Global Fund project, Zamiin-Uud center was by Red Cross Mongolia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of the health workers in provision of VCT service (2 trainings 30 participants from all 3 locations)</td>
<td>TA was responsible for the training on VCT of all relevant health personnel of Gavisumber, Sainshand and Zamiin-Uud, but regarding the resource persons and training handbook, it was provided by specially designated for VCT training NGO “Future without AIDS” with support from UNICEF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training on STI management (1 training, 25 participants from all 3 locations)</td>
<td>Training was provided by master trainers from NCCD. Trainers were trained within Global Funds’ STI syndromic diagnosis project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity building for the soum laboratory- long term training of the laboratory doctor</td>
<td>1 doctor from Zamiin-Uud was trained in the residency training at the Health Science University of Mongolia as laboratory doctor. It was an important step for future strengthening of laboratory in Zamiin-Uud border port.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision of testing kits (4500 HIV tests and 500 syphilis tests)</td>
<td>During the project implementation period a big scale campaign, named “Healthy Mongolian” had a place. Within this campaign a lots of HIV tests were purchased and distributed. In addition to that, there were HIV tests, procured by Global Fund project in quite sufficient number. So, procurement of HIV tests was unnecessary considering fact that many tests were unused and expiry dates were neared. Therefore, we agreed with Global Fund project to allocate sufficient number of HIV tests to our project sites. Later we procured only some Syphilis tests, requested by local health departments, in order to use during mobile VCT activities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.4 Component 4: Border control and police capacity building to prevent human trafficking

TA-4364 activities relating to trafficking fit into the following categories:

1. Production of materials for awareness raising
2. Behaviour change communication/peer education
3. Basic-level training of front-line police
4. Training and support for border officials
5. Initial support for bilateral/cross-border cooperation with China

Police and border offices, local communities were targeted by TA.

Table 3. Areas of interventions in regards to human trafficking prevention.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Areas of intervention</th>
<th>Achievements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Production of materials for awareness raising</td>
<td>IEC materials with human trafficking prevention messages developed and distributed through peer educators: leaflets, notebooks for youth and playing cards. TA has developed its own documentary movie on trafficking to show in training programmes as well as on television. Billboards were placed at Zamiin-Uud police station and also at the train stations (ticket offices). Billboards are used in order to provide information on human trafficking and HIV/AIDS for travellers/passengers of the train (so far almost only transport used by majority of the population).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behaviour change communication/ peer education</td>
<td>Peer education among vulnerable populations has been widely used in the response to HIV/AIDS but not with regard to trafficking prevention. TA-4364 provided the opportunity to explore the use of these peer education techniques as an overlooked strategy in the fight against trafficking. With regard to sex workers, this also allows a more holistic approach to the risks inherent in the sex trade, educating young women about the risks of trafficking and migration, alongside HIV and other sexually transmitted infections. The need for this type of more holistic approach to vulnerability is an emerging issue in the trafficking prevention sector and was one of the main points of discussion at an ADB workshop in Manila in late July, 2007 which reviewed experience in preventing trafficking over the past few years. TA coordinator had chance to present on this workshop and was well received. The successful combination of trafficking and HIV prevention activities attracted considerable interest among both ADB and non-ADB participants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic-level training of front-line police</td>
<td>The Project has modified its initially planned activities to bring these into line with the key priorities of the Mongolian government, as articulated in the National Plan of Action. This has meant revising the initial plan for a joint training of police and border officials into two separate trainings, and working on curriculum development, with the Ministry of Social Welfare (the coordinating Ministry for trafficking) and UNICEF, one of the two key donors at that time with regard to trafficking. Initial TOT was conducted by the joint effort with UNICEF. Police officers from central and local levels were involved and trained as teachers for the follow up police trainings. 8 follow-up trainings were organized in Govisumber and Dornogovi aimags with inclusion almost all police officers in the provinces (210 people involved).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and support for border officials</td>
<td>Initial training is being provided to border officials. There is considerable scope for follow-up training in this area. There is also scope for developing a more comprehensive assistance package including strengthened IT and case management networks. (8 computers were provided for the 8 immigration cabins)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Initial support for bilateral/cross-border cooperation with China | There were three different complementary processes in Mongolia and China in relation to human trafficking at that time: consular discussions on a range of topics, including victims of trafficking; a proposed bilateral meeting on law enforcement cooperation, and initial discussions about the possibility of some form of bilateral agreement. However, with the exception of the consular discussions, which are part of an annual process, there did not appear any clarity on the Mongolian side as to what specifically might be involved in these initiatives. According to request from MFA, TA provided information note with suggestions on cooperation with China. The note highlighted the range of areas in which Mongolia might seek to cooperate with China and provides examples from other countries. These included:  
- Mutual Legal Assistance and Extradition  
- Information/intelligence exchange  
- Treatment/protection of victims  
- Procedures for assisting and returning victims  
- Joint trainings |
| TA-4364’s main interest was in promoting cooperation at local levels. With respect to China, this presents two main challenges. One is that China has few mechanisms in place for identifying of trafficking victims and the other is that intelligence-sharing processes are generally highly centralised and therefore potentially too long to be effective in responding to an issue such as trafficking. According to TA’s request, Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs sent an official letter asking for joint meeting with Chinese and Mongolian Police officials on human trafficking issue, but we received no reply from the Chinese Embassy. TA was able just to start discussions at the local border port level (Zamiin-Uud, Erlian) and working with China on trafficking (and HIV) was identified very challenging. |
| Research and Evaluation | Awareness of the general population on human trafficking was evaluated through baseline and evaluation studies. |
5.5 Component 5: Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation

17 meetings of Central and local Steering Committees were organized during project implementation.

Data on project implementation progress was collected from the sites on the routine basis. Field trips of the TA Coordinator was the main way of routine monitoring.

Baseline and evaluation studies were conducted to assess changes after implementation. Case study to explore existence of the sex work and/or local women’s interaction with road construction workers or miners was conducted in the project sites.

6. PROJECT OUTCOMES

6.1 Finding of the evaluation survey

TA has conducted baseline and evaluation surveys in the project implementation sites. Targeted population groups, such as local youth (students, unemployed), vulnerable women, workplaces, road construction workers were involved in the studies. Due to the delay in road construction, baseline survey was conducted late- in 2007, while the project started in 2006. Therefore some data, such as data related to awareness raising were quite biased. Also, regarding the construction workers, most of the workers stayed for the certain period of time and tend to change for the next year. In addition to that small sample size of construction workers and absence of sex workers in the baseline, make impossible to measure any changes in the knowledge, attitude and practice. Therefore it was difficult to entirely assess the outcome of the TA implementation by baseline and evaluation studies.

Anyway those surveys gave us a number of information about project outcome. In summary, evaluation team concluded that project has been implemented successfully, pointing several strong improvements in the healthy behavior, like increased condom use, particularly consistent condom use and decreased involvement in casual sex.

Below we illustrated some key findings from the evaluation survey.

People, considering themselves that have enough knowledge on HIV/AIDS increased by 6.3-20.1%.

**Table 4. Knowledge on ways of transmission**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ways of transmission</th>
<th>Project sites</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through unprotected sex</td>
<td>I (95.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through infected needle and syringes</td>
<td>II (92.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From mother to child during preg.</td>
<td>III (83.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through unsecure blood and blood products</td>
<td>IY (81.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Through mosquito</td>
<td>Y (39.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing toilet and bath</td>
<td>YI (27.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share kitchen utilities</td>
<td>YII (33.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By kissing</td>
<td>YIII (19.5)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Slightly decrease was observed regarding the knowledge on the ways of transmission, which may be influenced by the fact that at the time of baseline project had started about 1 year before and the information was quite fresh, also there was higher involvement of the women (in Mongolia women tend to have higher knowledge due to more often involvement in
reproductive health service) in the baseline that in evaluation. But according to ranking, highest number of choice was given to first 4 correct ways of transmission. In addition, there was quite decreased number of choices of wrong ways of transmission. Therefore, we can assume that comprehensive knowledge regarding the transmission ways was improved.

**Table 5. Population involved in prevention activities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heard of these kind of activities and involved personally</th>
<th>Govisumber %</th>
<th>Sainshand %</th>
<th>Zamiin-uud%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Heard of these kind of activities</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total % of the population reached</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It was indicated in the evaluation report that almost half of the population were reached by the project interventions.

As of 2009, the number of people who have had casual sex with unregular partner has decreased from 20.7% down to 15.7%, in last 2 years.

**Graph 1. Percentage of people who have had casual sex in last 12 months**

Percentage of people who have had casual sex was increased by 10% among miners, road and construction workers whereas it was decreased somewhere between 11.6% to 30%, among unemployed youth(16.5%), railway workers(29.2%), students in high schools, colleges and universities (11.6%) and people who live in the neighborhood of road construction, railway and mining sites (30%).

Partners in casual sex were usually people they new before and it has decreased by 26.8% throughout the project implementation. Number of people who have had casual sex with sex worker in last 12 months have decreased by 6% between the year of 2007 and 2009.

**Graph 2. Partners in casual sex**
**Condom use**

67.4% of target groups were used condom during their last sexual intercourse. This indicator was 61.6% in 2007 and it shows 4.8% positive effect. Especially, railway workers, unemployed youth, miners, road and construction workers’ condom use during casual sex was increased.

**Table 6. Condom use during last sexual intercourse**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target population</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed youth</td>
<td>47.2</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workers from road and other construction and mining</td>
<td>57.5</td>
<td>72.7</td>
<td>15.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workers from railway</td>
<td>76.2</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>23.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students, higher grade students from secondary school</td>
<td>61.6</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local citizens () along the road, railway and local mining</td>
<td>64.4</td>
<td>62.5</td>
<td>(1.9)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the assessment result it was clear that using a condom is not new behavior to the target population, anymore. 89-94% of respondents were responded that they use condom regularly during casual sex. However, this indicator was only 50.5% with their sexual partner and spouses.

Although, the percentage of people who responded that they use condom during casual sex was 89-94%, the number of target populations who use condom, regularly, takes 40.7-76%. This is 15.4-31.7% better than the 2007 result.

Even though, there was no major change in number of target populations who use condom, the number of people who use condom regularly, have increased substantially. This shows positive effect in terms of quality.

**Table 7. People, who use condom**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of the partners</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Use condom</td>
<td>Constant use of condom</td>
<td>Use condom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With familiar person</td>
<td>88.9</td>
<td>24.1</td>
<td>88.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With stranger</td>
<td>87.6</td>
<td>43.3</td>
<td>94.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With SW</td>
<td>95.7</td>
<td>60.6</td>
<td>90.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With spouse</td>
<td>56.2</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>50.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Beside these findings of evaluation study, we collected data from aimag/soum drug stores. These data shows that number of the sold condoms steadily increasing last 2 years.

**Table 8. Total number of sold condoms in Govisumber, Sainshand and Zamiin-Uud**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No of sold condoms</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>As of September, 2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>30963</td>
<td>55305</td>
<td>66595</td>
<td>66740</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We can say that certain improvements have been observed in the people’s attitude to HIV testing. Those who have been answered that they usually get tested every year increased by 14%, those who have been tested after casual sex increased by 1.7%.

From the survey findings, 40.6% of respondents have had adequate knowledge, 52.3% didn’t have adequate knowledge and 7.1% haven’t heard about human trafficking, at all. However, percentage of those people who have heard about human trafficking was increased by 23.4%. Especially, this positive impact was observed better in Zamiin-Uud soum where has large number of mobile populations.

**Table 9. Information sharing about human trafficking**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sites</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adequate information</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Govisumber</td>
<td>19.1</td>
<td>41.0</td>
<td>21.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sainshand</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>40.4</td>
<td>24.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zamiin-Uud</td>
<td>17.8</td>
<td>56.7</td>
<td>38.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average</strong></td>
<td><strong>17.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>40.6</strong></td>
<td><strong>23.4</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inadequate information</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Govisumber</td>
<td>70.1</td>
<td>52.2</td>
<td>(18.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sainshand</td>
<td>71.6</td>
<td>52.4</td>
<td>(19.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zamiin-Uud</td>
<td>71.2</td>
<td>38.1</td>
<td>(33.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average</strong></td>
<td><strong>71.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>52.3</strong></td>
<td><strong>(18.8)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Never heard of it</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Govisumber</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>(3.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sainshand</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>(5.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zamiin-Uud</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>(5.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Average</strong></td>
<td><strong>11.7</strong></td>
<td><strong>7.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>(4.7)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 6.2 Achievement of DMF targets

In the table below we showed targets, set by the project, and achievements at the end of the project.

**Table 10. Achievements of the DMF targets**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes</th>
<th>Targets</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Baseline data</th>
<th>Evaluation data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcome 1</strong></td>
<td>To reduce the risk of transmission of STI/HIV/AIDS among local resident communities, particularly vulnerable poor and unemployed women and youths,</td>
<td>Sexually transmitted infection (STI) prevalence rate in aimag not higher than 2005 rates</td>
<td>Selected STI incidence rate (syphilis, gonorrhea, trichomoniasis) per 10000 population</td>
<td>in 2005 was 23.72 in Govisumber and 26.84 in Dornogovi aimag</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Knowledge of STI and HIV/AIDS transmission will increase by 15%</td>
<td>Average percentage of those, who know main transmission ways, baseline</td>
<td></td>
<td>80.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcomes</td>
<td>Targets</td>
<td>Indicators</td>
<td>Baseline data</td>
<td>Evaluation data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>secondary and high school students; construction workers and commercial sex workers (CSWs).</td>
<td>Increased knowledge of STI and HIV/AIDS prevention by 15%</td>
<td>Percentage of the people, who named “Constant use of condom in case of casual sex” as a way of HIV prevention (BS)</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>60%**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increased use of condoms by 20% among the populations by the end of the Road Project</td>
<td>Percentage of the population, who constantly use condom during casual sex (BS)</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>51.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of sold condoms in the aimag/soum will increase twice</td>
<td>Number of sold condom in 1 year through local drug stores</td>
<td>In 2006 was</td>
<td>In 2008 was 66595</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>HIV testing coverage will be improved by 15 %</td>
<td>Percentage of the population, who give HIV test at least once (BS)</td>
<td>34.6 %</td>
<td>41.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Percentage of the population, who give test every year</td>
<td>44.1%</td>
<td>58.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcome 2</strong></td>
<td>Demonstrated increase in awareness on trafficking among target populations, including what to do if cases occur</td>
<td>Percentage of the population, who were well informed about human trafficking (BS)</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>40.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Only incidence data was available from Health Statistics Department. Due to intensive communication activities and increased mobile testing, incidence of selected STIs became much higher in project sites.

**knowledge of the respondents was already quite high at the baseline. It may be influenced by the fact that at the time of baseline project had started about 1 year before and the information was quite fresh, also there was higher involvement of the women (in Mongolia women tend to have higher knowledge due to more often involvement in reproductive health service) in the baseline that in evaluation.
7. SUSTAINABILITY

In order to ensure sustainability of HIV/AIDS and trafficking prevention work, addressed by the TA, we tried to:

- Work within existing structures and mechanisms as much as possible;
- Work collaboratively with a range of government and non-government partners;
- Create and nurture linkages (locally and nationally) that will endure after Project completion;

Thus, in terms of HIV/AIDS, the project collaborated with the National Centre for Communicable Diseases (NCCD), the Health Promotion Department, National Centre for Health Development (NCHD), the Global Fund on HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Tuberculosis, UNICEF and the National AIDS Foundation, a local NGO. This included mutual support of training activities, with the Project participating in several training activities run by partner organisations and vice versa.

With regard to trafficking, Project's strategy was to work within the National Program on human trafficking prevention. This was shown in the training programmes, which work closely with existing government structures, and in the materials development where the team was working close with both local NGOs and external donor agencies such as the project in Ministry of Social Welfare, supported by UNICEF. As well as the Ministry of Social Welfare and the other key anti-trafficking donor, The Asia Foundation, the Project also maintained ongoing contact with its two key counterpart agencies, the Mongolian Police and the Central Office for Border protection in the Ministry of Justice and Internal Affairs.

In addition to that, main specialists from the local areas were involved in project implementation as key persons to implement the project. Since they are the people, who are responsible by their assignment for HIV/AIDS and human trafficking prevention, we believed that they will continue the work, started by the project. Also, due to TOTs and re-trainings and, multiple trainings and activities, conducted by themselves, they became really experienced specialist in their field. Which in turn will greatly contribute to the improvement of quality of HIV/AIDS and human trafficking responses in their aimags.

Another important issue, we addressed during the implementation was inclusion of HIV/AIDS related terms in the Specific conditions of the bidding document for contractors (construction companies) under Loan 2087-MON. Bidding document has the attachment of "Conditions of Contract for Construction for Building and Engineering Works Designed by the Employers, Multilateral Development Bank Harmonization Edition 2005, General Conditions" that was developed by the International Federation of Consulting Engineers (FIDIC). Section 6.7 Health and Safety covers all contractors' obligation to implement HIV/AIDS/STI related work. TA team with the support of The Project Manager of RRDP included specially developed phrases in the special conditions on obligations of the contractor to implement HIV/AIDS/STI related activities, and therefore, those additional conditions were discussed in the contract negotiation. This approach was very helpful in pursuing implementation of the HIV/AIDS work at the construction sites and in the future will be good experience for the similar projects and programs.

8. COST EFFECTIVENESS AND COORDINATION

Due to the limited resources of the TA, lots of attention was paid to the cooperation and co-financing approach. Example of this is indicated in the parts 5.3(cooperation on improving STI/HIV/AIDS service) and 5.4 (human trafficking prevention).
9. LESSONS LEARNT (KNOWLEDGE PRODUCT)

Reaching people at risk - Specially designed for target groups (CSW, road construction workers, youth and students) program aimed to provide reading materials and interactive training techniques focused on HIV/AIDS/STI prevention and human trafficking prevention. Sessions were free to select depending on the background of participants. Integration of these 2 topics in one training was quite successful in terms of educating almost same target groups (youth, adolescents and CSW) on 2 different, but interrelated topics.

Different methods were used to reach different groups, such as in terms of construction workers, inclusion of HIV issues in the contract for construction companies was crucial factor to get support from administrators of construction companies.

We should note that there was a problem in finding sex workers in countryside. There were no so-called “sex workers” in the countryside, but the big number of CSWs was concentrated in Erlian - Chinese border town. There were around 400 CSWs, organized into small groups of 5-10 and resided in “red light districts”. Project team was able to train 18 girls to become peer educators amongst others.

Community mobilization activities were organized mainly during World AIDS Day: knowledge competitions, parade, poster competition and competition of agencies with workplace HIV and AIDS programs. Work place program competition was successful in organizing HIV/AIDS prevention programs at the workplace, especially some long term workplace policy development efforts were made during the competition. One of the advantages of such a competition was giving to agencies chance to learn from each other at the end.

First training on TIP targeted for police officials – Human trafficking is a newly emerging crime in Mongolia. Because of that, almost all police staff was new to the issue. Therefore, introductory training was quite beneficial not only for local police staff but also for central police department as well. As a first training handout of this type, it will be useful even in the future for sensitizing police officers at the central and local level.

10. RECOMMENDATIONS

General recommendations

1. HIV/AIDS and human trafficking prevention project needs to be continued, taking into the consideration that human trafficking is one of factors for increasing the risk of HIV/AIDS transmission. Also, bringing together these two problems into one project has an advantage of saving human resources, funding and other resources. This is the first ever experience for our country and it needs to be expanded.

2. The support from local authorities needs to be strengthened in order to ensure the project sustainability. In particular, the creation of mechanism of sustainable cooperation between health, police and border control authorities in prevention of HIV/AIDS and human trafficking is crucial.

Recommendations on HIV/AIDS Prevention

1. Continue discussion with Department of Road and Ministry of Road Transportation and Urban Development on necessity of HIV prevention in the construction field, capacity building of relevant institutions and inclusion of HIV issues in the relevant regulations.

2. To create mechanism for routine collaboration of relevant officials of Department of Road and health people (MOH, Department of Health, NCCD).
3. To set peer education technique as one of the most effective approach for working with infrastructure projects. Within this approach to focus on small number of skillful and stable peer educators. To provide re-trainings for peer educators, in order to up to date with new information and knowledge. To encourage networking of peer educators with regular meetings, sport competitions in order to increase self confidence and fulfillment with their work.

4. To create monitoring and evaluation system, suitable for HIV projects, working in connection with infrastructure projects. The system should be incorporated into overall monitoring system in the country.

Recommendations on Human Trafficking Prevention

1. Development of a strategic framework to address trafficking in Mongolia based on the National Plan of Action, but with clear prioritisation of activities and mechanisms to measure impact.
2. Assisting the Mongolian government and other actors to identify and access high quality specialist anti-trafficking expertise as required.
3. Facilitation of cooperation between Mongolia and China on a range of levels.
4. Strengthening of the legal framework around trafficking.
5. Continuation of basic training on trafficking for front-line officials (police, border guards).
6. Start training for prosecutors and judges, which will contribute to strengthening cooperation on law enforcement/prosecution between all concerned parties in Mongolia.
7. Continuation and expansion of existing programmes to increase awareness and understanding of trafficking and related issues, particularly using interactive techniques such as peer education.
8. The investigation on possibility for inclusion of complex subject on human trafficking in curriculum of secondary schools, professional, and vocational training centers would make an important contribution in prevention of human trafficking by providing knowledge to improve understanding about this issue for both adolescents and youth.

11. CONCLUSION

1. Projects of this kind could be very effective way of expanding HIV prevention work into infrastructure sector. Sensitization of policy makers in infrastructure field in HIV prevention work could be beneficial by including necessary changes in the infrastructure related policy documents. One example if this was inclusion of additional clauses on HIV prevention into contracts for big scale construction works. But these activities require a lot of efforts on collaboration with different sectors.
2. The Project offered a rare opportunity to combine trafficking prevention activities with HIV/AIDS prevention activities, due to the fact that the target groups for these activities inevitably overlap. Moreover, it provided the opportunity to explore the use of peer education techniques as an overlooked strategy in the fight against trafficking.
3. Behavior change is very complex issue especially when it’s related to infrastructure projects. An integrated approach is crucial: awareness raising, followed by well planned and effective approach on behavior change, community mobilization and on the other hand, qualified and accessible health service.
4. Capacity building and involvement of existing structures is important to ensure sustainability of the project activities. Collaboration of Health authorities with aimag administration and other relevant sectors, like police,
infrastructure could be beneficial for organizing effective interventions at the local level.

12. ANNEXES

Annex A: List of Developed Materials (original copies will be sent by DHL)

1. Communication strategy
2. Situation Analysis
3. Handbook on peer education on HIV/AIDS and human trafficking prevention
4. Handbook on Introductory training for police officers and border officials
5. Leaflets 5 types
6. Playing card
7. Notebook
8. Documentary movies 2 types (movie on human trafficking and movie on TA implementation)
10. Case study report
Annex B: Communication Strategy

ADB TA4364: MONGOLIA

Awareness and Prevention of HIV/AIDS and Human Trafficking on the North-south Road Corridor

Communications Strategy for Trafficking Component

September 2006
Introduction

This document outlines the Communications Strategy for Project TA4364-MON. It comprises five sections as follows:

1. Project Goal and Objectives
2. Overall Project Strategy;
3. Main activity areas:
   i. Development and distribution of Communications Materials;
   ii. Project Approach to Training;
   iii. Condom use promotion
4. Monitoring and Evaluation
5. Sustainability of Project outcomes.

It should be read in conjunction with the Project Workplan.

1. Project Goal and Objectives

   Goal

   To reduce the transmission of STI/HIV/AIDS and prevent human trafficking in project aimags.

   Objectives

   • To reduce the risk of transmission of STI/HIV/AIDS among local resident communities, particularly vulnerable poor and unemployed women and youths, secondary and high school students; construction workers and commercial sex workers (CSWs).
   • To increase awareness among the same target groups the risks of human trafficking, how to reduce these risks and what to do if trafficking occurs.
   • To improve the capacity of government officials, particularly Police and border officials, to combat human trafficking through the provision of training and, where appropriate equipment, and through the facilitation of linkages with countries of destination, particularly China

2. Overall Project Strategy

Although both HIV/AIDS and, in particular, human trafficking issues are comparatively new to Mongolia, it is clear that, as elsewhere they will require long-term responses. On the other hand, as a Project attached specifically to the building of a new road, TA4364 is a comparatively small and short-term project. It is therefore important not only to maximise the benefits generated by the Project but also to work to ensure that activities supported by the Project lead to sustainable impact after its conclusion.

In addition, both issues involve a wide range of organisations, both Government and non-Government, with anti-trafficking programmes in particular encompassing law enforcement, border control, support for victims, education, international cooperation, and so on. Experience from elsewhere reveals many examples of overlap and duplication between different agencies.
Two areas where such overlaps can be particularly problematic are training and awareness raising, the two major activity areas for TA4364. In terms of training, not only is duplication a waste of resources but there is also major potential for confusion if the same issues are taught to the same people in different ways. In terms of awareness raising, again there is scope for confusion if agencies do not coordinate and agree on the key messages in advance. In addition, information on how and where to access assistance should be consistent across different awareness raising materials.

Coordination and cooperation with other agencies and projects working against HIV/AIDS trafficking in Mongolia is not only important therefore in ensuring the sustainability of Project outcomes, but also in reducing the potential for duplication and overlap which could otherwise dilute the already limited level of resources with which to combat both these issues.

With this in mind, the Project’s key strategies involve:

- Working within existing structures and mechanisms as much as possible;
- Working collaboratively with a range of government and non-government partners;
- Creating and nurturing linkages (locally, nationally and internationally) that will endure after Project completion;
- Emphasising capacity development through high quality training programmes, and ensuring that courses intended as training of trainers combine technical content with work on training skills (see section three); and
- Drawing on the latest in international experience and lessons learned.

In terms of HIV/AIDS, the project has already begun work with the National Centre for Communicable Diseases (NCCS), the National Centre for Health Development (NCHD), the Global Fund on HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Tuberculosis and the National AIDS Foundation, a local NGO. This includes mutual support of training activities, with the Project participating in several training activities run by partner organisations and vice versa.

The National Centre for Communicable Diseases is a particularly important partner and will provide training of project counterparts on diagnosis and treatment of STIs as well as voluntary counselling and testing. The Global Fund will assist in providing condoms in project target areas, while a large international NGO, Marie Stopes International is assisting the Project with condom social marketing in Govisumber Province.

With regard to trafficking, the Project has modified its initially planned activities to bring these into line with the key priorities of the Mongolian government, as articulated in the National Plan of Action. This has meant revising the initial plan for a joint training of police and border officials into two separate trainings, and working on curriculum development, with the Ministry of Social Welfare (the coordinating Ministry for trafficking) and UNICEF, one of the two key donors with regard to trafficking.

As well as the Ministry of Social Welfare, the Project also maintains ongoing contact with its two key counterpart agencies, the Mongolian Police and the Central Office for Border protection in the Ministry of Justice and Internal Affairs, as well as the other key anti-trafficking donor, The Asia Foundation. The Project is also working to establish a linkage between the Mongolian Police and the Asia Regional Prevention of People Trafficking Project (ARCPPT), which works closely with most of the ASEAN countries on criminal justice response to trafficking and also provides training to the Australian Federal Police. This will provide the Police with ongoing access to up-to-date information on international good practice in combating trafficking, including the latest in training materials and techniques, and examples of successful efforts in cross-border cooperation. In addition, through the international anti-trafficking adviser, the Project will maintain links with partners in other parts
of the world, to ensure access to new information, experiences and lessons learned in combating trafficking.

In terms of the Project’s work on Behaviour Change Communication, incorporating both HIV and trafficking, the Project is again working through existing structures, supporting the formation of multi-disciplinary teams comprised of staff of key departments at aimag (provincial) level. These departments include the Governor’s Office, the Ministry of Health, the Police and the Border Guards. In most provinces, there is also track record of cooperation with NGOs, which the Project will be in a position to capitalise and build on. This includes a legal NGO based in Zamyn-Uud on the border with China.

Importantly, work towards reducing risky behaviour relating to trafficking, will draw on two decades of experience in the HIV/AIDS sector. This highlights that raising awareness activities in themselves are often insufficient to bring about positive behaviour change, an issue which is discussed in detail in the following section. Perhaps somewhat surprisingly, peer education techniques among vulnerable populations, widely used in the response to HIV/AIDS are almost unheard of with regard to trafficking prevention in many parts of the world. The Project therefore provides the opportunity to explore the use of these peer education techniques as an overlooked strategy in the fight against trafficking.

3. Main activity areas

i. Development and distribution of Communication Materials

This section refers specifically to the development of communication materials for the Project’s target groups, specifically: sex workers, construction workers, members of communities affected by the road (particularly youth at risk, commercial drivers, and those undertaking risky migration decisions. In addition the Project plans to development basic information sheets on HIV and trafficking for a wider audience. Awareness raising relating to government officials will predominantly take place through the training components, which are detailed in the section on Training below.

While the international response to HIV is relatively advanced, the same cannot be said for human trafficking and there are a number of specific issues around the development of communication materials in this sector. A special sub-section has therefore been devoted to this below.

Considerations relating to awareness raising on human trafficking

The development and production of awareness raising materials on trafficking is one of the core anti-trafficking interventions across the world. In fact, more resources have almost certainly been devoted to this area than any other. Yet there is little evidence that such materials have in general had any significant impact on the trafficking problem.

There are a number of reasons for this including:

- Many messages produced by anti-trafficking campaigns do not accurately reflect the trafficking situation. For example, the majority or early prevention messages in South Asia focused on the likelihood of victims being trafficked by strangers (stranger-danger) until it was discovered that a considerable proportion, perhaps the majority, of victims were trafficked by people they knew (initial information suggests a similar pattern in Mongolia, accentuated by a tendency to regard a broker that one has met 2-3 times as a ‘friend’ rather than stranger).

- Some messages are not properly understood by the target group for a range of reasons, including lack of clarity, language issues, or that the target group know about trafficking but understand it in a different manner (for example,
seeing it in terms of 'lucky' and 'unluckily' migration).

- Perhaps more commonly, messages need to be consistent with the personal experience of the target group. For example, existing training materials in Mongolia contain a section on myths and realities. One of the myths is that one can make money by migrating. Yet this idea is not a myth at all. Many people do improve their lives by migrating and messages which ignore this are unlikely to be credible.
- Many messages provide only warnings and do not offer options for people to reduce their risks or report cases of trafficking.
- Monitoring and Evaluation of awareness raising campaigns is often nonexistent thus not providing information which could indicate their impact and assist in making them more successful.
- Campaigns may succeed in raising awareness but this may not lead to behaviour change. This is the subject of the next section.

Many of these factors are highly relevant also to HIV/AIDS, and there is clear scope for better adaptation of the lessons learned in the HIV/AIDS sector to the human trafficking sector.

**Awareness Raising and Behaviour Change**

Most awareness raising programmes on trafficking appear to be based on the (generally unspoken) assumption that raising awareness of the target population will lead to behaviour change. Yet, there are clear examples in everyday life that this is not automatically the case. Issues such as drinking and driving, drug use and smoking all remain problems despite high levels of awareness of the dangers involved.

Of more direct relevance to the Project, unsafe sexual behaviour, leading to risks of HIV and other Sexually Transmitted Diseases, continues throughout the world despite many awareness raising campaigns. Within the HIV prevention movement, this has been recognised by the development of a new term, Behaviour Change Communication (BCC), which recognises that providing basic information is not often sufficient to bring about change.

In addition to issues identified above related to the accuracy of messages, reasons that awareness raising messages may not change behaviour include:

- Peer pressure.
- Existence of alternative, competing sources of information – for example, a person may know several people who have migrated safely and earned a lot of money.
- Lack of alternatives to risk taking behaviour – for example, family is very poor;
- Inability of the target group to ‘internalize’ risk (‘this will never happen to me’).
- Willingness to take known risks – as noted above, the vast majority of people who migrate actually improve their lives by doing so. People may know there are risks but be prepared to take them particularly if, as noted above there is a degree of peer pressure involved.

Overall, therefore, just as it is now widely understood that simple warnings about HIV do little to stem the spread of the virus, acknowledging that warning people about the dangers of trafficking may not stop them migrating is very important for developing effective anti-trafficking responses. Awareness-raising is important but must deal with the realities of people’s lives. In addition, small changes are easier to make than larger ones so it can sometimes be easier to encourage safer migration than to stop migration.
The Project’s approach to the development of awareness raising materials in both HIV/AIDS and trafficking will be based on the lessons learned above. The Project will use the terms IEC and awareness raising to refer to the development and distribution of materials, while using the term BCC to refer to more interactive methods of communication such as peer education. The Project will not automatically assume a link between raised awareness and changes in behaviour in its monitoring and evaluation.

The development of materials will be based on the following principles:

1. Materials must be based on accurate information about the trafficking and HIV situations.
2. The target groups for different messages will be clearly articulated and materials tailored to their needs. In addition, they will take account of the context in which they will be seen. For example, the Project plans to post information on reducing migration and trafficking in public places such as bars and restaurants. This will include preparatory steps to take before migrating (such as checking on the recruiter). The Project also plans to post information on migration and trafficking on the trains to the borders, as well as at the key border points. The information provided in the latter locations will not be exactly the same, however, as it will need to take into account that the migration experience has already started.
3. Messages need to provide a range of alternatives for action. With regard to HIV, this includes ensuring that messages include possible reductions in the number of sexual partners and promotion of condom use. Regarding trafficking, options to reduce the risks of migration need to be provided rather than just discouraging this migration. Information also needs to be provided about how to access help if there is a case of trafficking (or a migration experience goes wrong). All materials developed will include advice on how to seek assistance and/or additional information3.
4. Materials used in awareness raising will be pre-tested with a sample of target group wherever possible.
5. Any awareness raising campaigns will include a monitoring component as a matter of course, to measure their effectiveness. In particular, the baseline survey and follow-up will include key questions relating to trafficking to measure any changes in awareness. In terms of HIV, the Project will also draw on other surveys as appropriate. On trafficking, where less information is available, the Project team will also liaise with agencies working with returned victims to identify their pre-existing knowledge of trafficking and modify any messages accordingly.
6. The Project will cooperate closely with others to ensure messages are consistent and avoid overlap and duplication. Anti-trafficking and HIV prevention messages will also be integrated as appropriate opportunities arise.
7. A range of different media will be used for awareness raising (posters, dvds, etc). Dvds in particular are a very popular and cost effective method of sharing information in Mongolia. In addition, one of the major ways that traffickers recruit their victims is by advertisements in newspapers. The Project has raised the possibility of a ‘counter-campaign’, with adjacent advertisements offering to provide further information. This suggestion has attracted considerable interest and is currently being assessed by both the Police and TPolice and The Asia Foundation.

3 For example, several agencies in Mongolia have already worked together to develop a small handout for migrants which contains the address of Mongolia’s Embassies and Consulates in the major destination countries, together with requests written in local languages to assist the migrant to contact these Embassies/consulates.
8. Where possible, awareness raising materials will be developed in a participatory manner. In particular, the Project will use the TOT prevention workshop and follow-up workshops to generate new materials through asking participants to develop and design their own. The best materials will be considered for reproduction and distribution.

ii. Project Approach to Training
The Project’s training activities are a key part of its communication strategy as, through direct training, and training of trainers it will directly and indirectly reach a wide audience. The key considerations with regard to training are listed below:

1. Issues around trafficking cannot be learned passively. For example, explaining to people how HIV can spread quickly throughout a community has not proven as effective as basic role-plays which demonstrated the same point. Similarly, providing participants with a definition of trafficking alone has repeatedly been shown to have little impact. Participants need to work through and discuss specific case studies in order to develop a clear understanding of what trafficking is and is not. Similarly, people cannot be told how to interview victims. This requires practical exercises and training.

2. Training is a specific skill. Much of what is currently called training of trainers is in fact better described as lecturing of lecturers. Project TA4364 recognises that training, particularly the type of interactive training suitable for trafficking and HIV prevention work, is a specific skill which requires specific training.

3. Training requires follow-up and, in some cases, refresher training. Further, preliminary training should aim to provide a foundation for further training, where this is appropriate. For example, while specific investigation training for Police would be extremely valuable, this is a relatively complex area. Initial training should not attempt to address this but should lay the groundwork for future training by providing a clear understanding of the trafficking crime and tools to combat this.

With these considerations in mind, the Project’s approach to training will involve:

- A strong focus on participatory methods;
- Strong emphasis on training skills and experience in recruitment of local project staff;
- Drawing on existing training curriculum and materials, both from within Mongolia, and throughout the Asian region;
- Ensuring that TOT activities incorporate a large segment on specific training skills;
- On-the-job training for trainers through Project staff assisting them in running their initial courses as appropriate; and
- Pre- and post-testing of training, together with follow-up activities.

iii. Condom use promotion
A social marketing approach will be used in order to promote condom use.

This will include:

- Creation of condom selling network with support of government officials. Network will include hotels, bars and shops at the aimag and soum centers;
- Provision of free condoms to main selling points to initiate revolving funds for condom selling;
- Use of existing networks for condom supply (branch of Mongol Emimpex)
• Promotion of condom use through IEC campaigns, IEC materials and trained peer educators

4. Monitoring and Evaluation

Monitoring and Evaluation is being built into the Project workplan through Component 5: Benefit Monitoring and Evaluation. It will cover all aspects of the Project. Given that it is not possible to use the number of trafficking cases as an indicator, and that the number of HIV cases is also a problematic measure within the Project timeframe, other methods of measuring project progress and achievements will need to be developed. Evaluation criteria for HIV/AIDS prevention will be developed within criteria, indicated in National Strategy for HIV/AIDS Prevention. An emphasis will be placed on quality of project outputs, rather than quantity.

Key Monitoring and Evaluation activities will include:

• A baseline survey which includes both HIV and trafficking question, combined with follow-up surveys to measure existing understanding and changes to this understanding over time;
• Pre and post-test questionnaires for training workshops;
• Evaluation forms for training workshops;
• Operational monitoring indicators, collected quarterly from aimag TA team
• Regular ongoing dialogue with key partners to identify any changes resulting from Project activities (most significant change monitoring).
• Steering Committee meeting, held quarterly at the Central and Aimag level

5. Sustainability of Project Outcomes

In broad terms, project activities can be divided into two categories. Some relate specifically to issues that fall largely within the life of the Project. In particular, this relates to work on HIV prevention linked to those groups involved directly or indirectly with building the road. In this regard, the immediate outcomes of the Project are most important. However, the broader issue of HIV prevention, and of human trafficking, will continue long after the Project’s completion, as will the impacts of the new road. It is therefore extremely important that, even at this relatively early stage, the Project place issues of sustainability at the forefront.

Many of the issues relating to project sustainability have already been touched on above. In particular, the following approaches will all contribute to sustainability of project outcomes:

• Working within existing structures and mechanisms as much as possible. As well as rationalising the use of project resources, this will help to facilitate institutionalisation of project outcomes and approaches;
• Working collaboratively with a range of government and non-government partners. Almost all of these partners, whether government, local or international NGOs, or donors, will continue to operate after the completion of TA4364 and will be in a position to build on the achievements on the Project;
• Creating and nurturing linkages (locally, nationally and internationally) that will endure after Project completion; and
• Emphasising capacity development through high quality training programmes, and ensuring that courses intended as training of trainers combine technical content with work on training skills (see section three).

With regards to the last point above, the three local staff working currently on the Project already have considerable experience in the areas of HIV and trafficking, and will continue to be linked with work on these issues through the organisations they will go back to at the end of their involvement in the Project (the National Centre for Health Development and National
University of Mongolia/Open Academy). Thus, all staff will continue to be a resource for the wider anti-HIV and anti-trafficking sectors. A key way of ensuring sustainability of Project outcomes would be to invest in the development of these personnel, building on their existing knowledge and expertise and capitalising on opportunities to expose them to international experience through direct on-the-job training and participate in any international workshops which would be appropriate.

Finally, the Project will make all its training and other materials freely available to other agencies working on the issue, while ensuring due credit and acknowledgment to ADB.
Annex C: Situation Analysis on Human Trafficking

ADB TA4364: MONGOLIA

Awareness and Prevention of HIV/AIDS and Human Trafficking on the North-south Road Corridor

Situation Analysis on Human Trafficking

May 2006
**Table of Contents**

1. Introduction ............................................................................................................3
2. Executive Summary ..................................................................................................4
3. Overview of Trafficking Situation in Mongolia ......................................................5
4. Overview of Responses in Mongolia to date ..........................................................7
   4.1 Prevention Activities .......................................................................................8
   4.2 Prosecution/Criminal Justice Responses .......................................................9
   4.3 Protection – Services to victims ....................................................................12
   4.4 Policy, Coordination and Cooperation .........................................................12
   4.5 Suggested Imperatives for Mongolia ............................................................13
5. Issues for TA 4364...............................................................................................14
   5.1 Potential Impact of the Road Project ............................................................14
   5.2 Training Activities already planned ...............................................................15
   5.3 Working with the Police ................................................................................15
   5.4 Working with Border Officials .......................................................................16
       Computerised Border Management System ......................................................17
   5.5 Development of Awareness Raising Materials .............................................18
   5.6 Monitoring and Evaluation ............................................................................18
   5.7 Sustainability ................................................................................................19
Annex 1: Proposed workplan .................................................................................20
1. Introduction

This report briefly outlines the human trafficking situation in Mongolia, the responses being developed to address this situation, and the potential contribution that can be made by the ADB Project TA 4364.

It is based on information from the following sources:

- Initial discussions with representatives from the main agencies involved in the fight against trafficking;
- Site visits to both the Chinese and Russian borders;
- A review of existing reports on the problem (the report ‘Combating Human Trafficking in Mongolia: Issues and Opportunities produced by the Centre for Human Rights and Development in cooperation with several other agencies, was particularly informative and has been referred to frequently in writing this report);
- Information obtained from reports that have not yet been published; and
- Feedback from participants at a two-day introductory trafficking workshop organised by The Asia Foundation.

Lessons learned from responses to trafficking internationally have also been drawn on where appropriate.

The report is necessarily impressionistic as the main purpose of the analysis is to provide a basis for the development of project activities. It should therefore be viewed as an indicative analysis, specifically with a view to TA 4364, rather than a definitive report on the current trafficking situation in Mongolia.

The report presupposes a basic level of understanding about human trafficking. General introductory information on trafficking can be found in another ADB Report: Preventing the Trafficking of Women and Children and Promoting Safe Migration in the Greater Mekong Sub-region produced in August 2005 under Project RETA 6190.

About Project TA 4364

ADB is supporting a Regional Road Development Project which will develop the remaining section of Mongolia’s north-south road transport corridor between Choij and Zamyn-Uud on the border with the People’s Republic of China (PRC). Once completed, this road will link the Asian highway networks of the PRC and the Russian Federation (Russia).

As well as the road building itself, the Project includes:

1. A cross-border transport facilitation plan;
2. Road safety improvement;
3. Area development to maximise the poverty reduction impact of the Project; and

In developing the Regional Road Development Project, it was recognised that the construction of the road, while bringing many positive benefits may also potentially increase the spread of HIV/AIDS and other STIs, as well as exposing an increased number of people to the risks of human trafficking.

Project TA4364 aims to mitigate these risks through a series of inter-related activities involving awareness raising; peer education with vulnerable populations; and strengthening border control capacity against human trafficking. The Project offers a rare opportunity to
combine trafficking prevention activities with HIV/AIDS prevention activities, due to the fact that the target groups for these activities will overlap.

2. Executive Summary

Trafficking is a relatively recent phenomenon in Mongolia and new information on this problem is emerging all the time. No reliable estimates are available on the size of the problem. It does appear, however, that the problem is considerably greater than had previously been understood.

At this point, the main trafficking pattern appears to be trafficking of women and girls for sexual exploitation in China (particularly Macau and Beijing). Trafficking also occurs for forced labour under false marriage. In addition, the large amount of migrant labour from Mongolia to countries known as destination points for trafficking suggests that this area warrants further investigation.

Rumours persist of trafficking for organs but there have been no confirmed cases to date. Some reports exist of internal trafficking for sexual exploitation and forced labour.

Mongolia’s response to trafficking is at an early stage and does not yet comprehensively address all aspects of the problem. The approval of a National Plan of Action against Sexual Exploitation and Trafficking of Children in late November 2005 should assist in this process, together with the formation of five technical working groups to address various priorities in the anti-trafficking response.

Perhaps the biggest constraint facing this response is that, for most trafficking cases involving Mongolians, the worst aspects of the trafficking crime, in terms of exploitation and profit, usually takes place in other countries, outside the jurisdiction of Mongolia. This means that international cooperation will be a key component of any effective response. In addition, Mongolia’s legal framework (laws and procedures) is not yet set up to deal with trafficking cases in an effective manner. Only a partial definition of the trafficking crime currently exists under the Penal Code, while the other offences that could be used to prosecute trafficking cases often have very weak punishments.

With regard to TA4364, many of the activities planned by the Project overlap with activities already planned by other agencies. While this provides some early complications and necessitates some modification of Project plans, it also highlights that the proposed activities are in line with the Government’s top priorities on this issue. It also offers opportunities for increased results, particularly in terms of sustainability of Project impact after Project activities are completed.

In particular, it makes sense for the Project to work together with the agencies on the development of the training materials to ensure that there is no duplication and overlap. It is also important for the Project to try to tap into ongoing processes to make sure the training is not a one-off activity. The fact that the Project will be working outside of the main centres of Ulan Bataar and Darkhan was also greatly welcomed by several contacts.

3. Overview of Trafficking Situation in Mongolia

Trafficking is a relatively recent phenomenon in Mongolia and new information on this problem is emerging all the time. As elsewhere, no reliable estimates are available on the size of the problem. Recent groundbreaking research undertaken by the Gender Equality Centre (report not yet finalised) has, however, suggested that the problem is considerably greater than had previously been appreciated. The GEC research team travelled to four destination points – Hong Kong, Macau, Beijing, Korea – as well as interviewing returned migrants and members of potentially vulnerable groups. Other information has been received from returned victims, relatives of missing women and children and law enforcement officials.
From the information available it is possible to say that there are several different trafficking patterns in Mongolia. While, at this stage, trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation appears to be by far the dominant category, it is important to note that this may be partly because other forms of exploitation are not necessarily seen as trafficking.

Despite the presence of very long land borders with China and Russia, all contacts agree that the borders are very well policed and trafficked victims, like other migrants, invariably travel through official border points. No visa is required for crossing to China, meaning illegal crossing is unnecessary. There does, however, appear to be a growth in false passports, containing visas for destinations further afield.

**Trafficking to China for Sexual Exploitation**

Women and girls are being trafficked into the sex trade in several destinations in China, including Beijing, Macau and Hong Kong. The typical arrangement appears to be one of debt bondage, that is, women are ‘sold’ to an entertainment place and then have to work to pay off their debt. In the space of a few days, the GEC research team reportedly found 50 women working in bars in Beijing alone, of whom many are believed to be in debt bondage. At least some of these women have some freedom of movement but have no easy way to access any assistance. Trafficking use a variety of methods to maintain control over their victims, ranging from direct force to threats to expose their involvement in the sex trade to families and communities.

In some cases, women who pay off this ‘debt’ are then reportedly offered $250 per head to recruit new victims. A combination of issues related to trauma and the fact that they would otherwise have nothing to show for their horrendous experience, leads a number of the victims to take up this offer, thus perpetuating the trafficking cycle. A further benefit for the trafficking networks is that these women are currently the most likely to be caught in anti-trafficking efforts, while those perpetuating the worst abuses remain untouched.

Otherwise, recruitment of victims is often done through newspaper advertisements often blatantly seeking young attractive women. Sometimes these advertisements are for positions in China, while in others applicants are told they must first travel to China to get a visa for onward travel to another destination. Employment/equality laws do not prevent such advertising in Mongolia at the present time. A range of options exist for addressing this recruitment practice, although other recruitment methods are more complex.

A considerable number of women from Mongolia also work in the sex trade in Erlian, China – just over the border from Zamyn-Uud at the southernmost point of the new road development. (Chinese women are not permitted to work in the sex trade there!). While there have been no reports that any of these women have been trafficked, they may be vulnerable to onward trafficking within China. These women have to return to Mongolia every 30 days to renew their visa which provides a possible intervention point for both trafficking and HIV. Any such interventions will need to take extreme care to address issues of ethics, confidentiality and possible stigmatisation of the women.

**Trafficking/exploitative marriage**

As in other countries bordering on China, the disparity in the number of men and women in China has created high demand for cross-border marriage. Many Mongolian women marry Chinese men and some of these find themselves in highly exploitative situations which they are unable to escape.
Trafficking for Adoption

Isolated cases have been reported of trafficking for adoption to China, at least one of which was intercepted at the border.

Internal Trafficking

The report from the Gender Equality Centre finds evidence of some internal trafficking for the sex trade, and a recent workshop of government officials and NGOs identified mining sites as possible venues for trafficking, particularly for child trafficking. Again, the information is limited at this stage.

Trafficking for Organs

While there is no hard evidence of this, and in fact there is not a single clearly documented case in Asia to date, there is sufficient anecdotal evidence for serious concern, notably the apparent disappearance of many street children, reports from street children that they have been approached by Chinese men, offered meals and had their stomachs examined, a newspaper article asserting that a nine year-old Mongolian girl was reportedly found dead in the streets of Beijing, minus her organs, and persistent rumours of organ ‘harvesting’ in China. More information is urgently required on this issue.

Other

To date, there has been just one reported cases of trafficking for labour exploitation (to Taiwan). However, a great number of Mongolian citizens work outside the country including in Korea (reportedly 100,000 per year) Taiwan and Hong Kong, all of which are known to be destination countries for trafficked labour. More than 2000 organisations are involved in international labour recruitment in Mongolia and monitoring is weak. Again, the fact that local conceptualisations of trafficking are heavily linked to the sex trade may contribute to the lack of any identified victims for labour exploitation.

An isolated case was also found to Europe. Interestingly, this was through Beijing rather than Russia. Trafficking to Russia is not generally thought to be significant, particularly as the parts of Russia closest to Mongolia have very similar economic conditions.

Comment

As a sending country, it needs to be recognised that there is a limited amount that Mongolia will be able to achieve without cooperation from the points and countries of destination. The prompt identification of victims, their appropriate treatment and the apprehension of those at the end of the exploitative trafficking chain are all fundamental to an effective response to trafficking. Much of this will inevitably remain outside of Mongolia’s control and strong international cooperation will be required.

4. Overview of Responses in Mongolia to date

In overall terms, the response to trafficking in Mongolia is at a nascent stage. It is characterised by a mixture of standard interventions, inevitable difficulties in distinguishing between trafficking, smuggling and prostitution, notably among law enforcement, and a number of genuinely innovative ideas and interventions which augur well for the future of Mongolia’s anti-trafficking response.

The National Plan of Action on Commercial Sexual Exploitation and Trafficking of Children was approved in late November 2005. It is a significant development and will act as an overarching framework for Mongolia’s national response. The NPA is, in general, a strong first Plan but unfortunately, contains only a partial definition of trafficking, referring only to women
and children. This means that the NPA is not fully in step with the international consensus definition of trafficking contained in the UN Trafficking in Persons Protocol. It also contributes to the automatic association of trafficking and the sex trade and facilitates the perception of certain stereotypes about who is trafficked and why.  

To assist in implementing the NPA, five inter-agency working groups have been established as follows:

- Training
- Public Awareness
- Research and monitoring
- Law Reform
- Victim Support

Each of these groups has developed their own implementation plan and the Training plan potentially overlaps considerably with the initial plans of TA4364 (see below for more details).

The major donors on trafficking to date appear to be UNICEF and The Asia Foundation, with ILO, Save the Children and World Vision also involved. ECPAT has established a network of 30 local organisations working on issues relating to child sexual exploitation and trafficking.

4.1 Prevention Activities

Prevention activities can generally be divided into activities to raise awareness of the trafficking problem and support for alternatives to migration such as income-generating projects. It is unlikely, given the income disparities between Mongolia and the trafficking destination points and the fact that traffickers can easily move to new recruitment points, that the latter approach will have much impact and Mongolia has to date focused little attention on this area. There is also little evidence to date that lack of education is a significant factor in assessing the risks of being trafficked. In fact, those with higher levels of education are often more likely to migrate, in search of better-paid work.

A number of awareness raising activities are being discussed including the production of TV and radio programmes, posters and leaflets. TOT programmes are also now being developed with a view to teaching in schools as well as peer education among at-risk groups, notably sex workers.

Care needs to be taken in developing messages in a number of areas. First, messages need to accurately reflect the trafficking situation. In other countries, many messages focused on the likelihood of victims being trafficked by strangers (stranger-danger) until it was discovered that a considerable proportion, perhaps the majority, of victims were trafficked by people they knew (initial information suggests a similar pattern in Mongolia, accentuated by a tendency to regard a broker that one has met 2-3 times as a ‘friend’ rather than stranger).

Second, messages need to be consistent with the personal experience of the target group. For example, existing training materials in Mongolia contain a section on myths and realities. One of the myths is that one can make money by migrating. Yet this idea is not a myth at all. Many people do improve their lives by migrating and messages which ignore this are unlikely to be credible.

Third, messages need to provide information about how to access help if a migration experience goes wrong. It is inevitable that people will continue to migrate and even those

---

4 For detailed discussion on this issue, see ARCPPT’s Gender Strategy, available on www.arcppt.org
who migrate through legal channels may get into severe difficulties from which they cannot escape. It is therefore important that this is taken into account in developing awareness raising materials. This is an area where Mongolia is already more advanced than many countries who have been working on trafficking for much longer. Several agencies have worked together to develop a small handout for migrants which contains the address of Mongolia’s Embassies and Consulates in the major destination countries, together with requests written in local languages to assist the migrant to contact these Embassies/consulates.

Another innovative response which links prevention and law enforcement, is the successful advocacy by local NGOs to have the immigration forms filled out upon leaving the country amended to require adults to provide information on any children they are accompanying out of the country. This is a small but highly significant change which has already led to Border Officials identifying several suspect cases.

On the related issue of child sex tourism a national tourist association has been formed, comprised of 160 organisations which have signed a Code of Conduct. The association has no powers of sanction, however.

4.2 Prosecution/Criminal Justice Responses

As the Project will be working on training for Police and Border Officials, it is important to both understand the legal framework in which law enforcement is operating, and assess how law enforcement efforts are best targeted in Mongolia. A particular challenge in investigating cross-border trafficking is that the exploitative aspects are not usually apparent until after the border has been crossed, making interception of cases very difficult.

Legal Framework

Mongolia adopted a new Constitution in 1992, which ensure the fundamental rights of its citizens and includes the right to life, the right to be free from discrimination, right to freedom of movement, right to freedom from forced labour and right to favourable work conditions.

Mongolia has not yet ratified the Convention on Transnational Organised Crime or the Supplementing Protocol on Trafficking in Persons, but plans are underway to do so, possibly by the end of the year.

Article 113 of the Criminal Code prohibits the ‘buying and selling of human beings’ but only categorises this as a ‘rather serious’ crime, the second lowest of the four crime types, with limited penalties. There is some provision for greater penalties in certain circumstances including crimes against two or more persons, against a child, for sexual exploitation or use of organs. However, ‘buying and selling’ does not fully encompass the crime of trafficking.

Other laws that could be used in trafficking cases include labour laws (including against forced and child labour), laws on illegal adoption and exchange of children, and laws against organised criminal activity. Punishments are often light, however. For example, forced labour is punishable by a fine of US$ 4-25.

Civil law remedies are also possible but financial compensation is only currently possible for loss and physical damage, and excludes emotional/psychological damage. Another relevant law is that prohibiting advertisements that deceive or mislead consumers (see note on disruption strategies below).

---

5 Drawn mainly from the CHRD study referenced above.
In addition to the laws, it is important to look at various legal procedures, some of which make it more difficult to apprehend and prosecute traffickers. For example, prosecutors only have 30-45 days to investigate and file charges related to Article 113. In addition, there is confusion between Article 113 and Article 124 concerning prostitution. Article 124 classifies selling of sex as an administrative offence, and victims of trafficking into the sex trade are vulnerable to being charged under this law. (There is no law against buying sex, a gender-based double standard which is common throughout the world).

Work is being undertaken on development of new laws against trafficking, notably by an inter-agency working group. However, it is likely that this will still take some time.

**Enforcement of Laws and Disruption Techniques**

While some 20 trafficking cases have been taken to Court to date, only three have been successfully prosecuted (one under Article 113 and two under other laws. By contrast, legal action has been taken against a number of victims for immigration or prostitution offences. Eleven investigations are currently underway, two of which are now in the court system.

Pending development of new laws against trafficking, a range of existing laws will need to be used. This has implications for the Police training to be undertaken by the Project, which will need to incorporate. During the field visit, Police officers produced an old booklet explaining the Criminal Code and explained that this was particularly useful. It may be worthwhile to produce a small booklet for law enforcers, describing all the laws that can be used to prosecute trafficking-related crimes. Al Capone, probably the most famous gangster of all time was finally brought down by tax evasion charges, for example.

Given the current status of the legal framework, it might also be very useful for Mongolia to explore what are known as disruption strategies. This means using a series of measures to make it difficult for traffickers to carry out their work. Disruption strategies would include following up and exposure of false advertisements, restriction of suspected traffickers from crossing the border, and repeated closure of establishments for breaches of health regulations, being open too late, etc.

**Training**

As part of the implementation of the NPA, one training workshop took place for state inspectors in mid-April and similar workshops are planned for Police and Border Officials in May and June respectively. In addition, the Swedish Government supported a training workshop with Ministry of Justice, involving Police, Prosecutors and Judges, in late April. Some Police have also had training on child labour issues.

All of these trainings are currently scheduled as one-off activities. They are of 2-3 days duration, sufficient for an introduction to the issue but insufficient for any real scenario-based investigation training. In fact, at the present time, the emphasis appears to be on a lecture-type approach to the issue. This is based on the perfectly understandable rationale that knowledge levels are very low, so that the trainings should be used to provide as much information as possible. However, issues such as the whether a case is trafficking or not cannot be properly learnt in this manner. It is a complex issue and knowing a theoretical definition is insufficient without the practice of working and analysing various case studies. Similar issues also apply to aspects of the trafficking response, particularly as these relate to the Police. For example, appropriate techniques for interviewing victims are not something that can be learned from a lecture.

The Project therefore is seeking to work with partners to develop more interactive training techniques, based on latest international understanding of the trafficking issue. This requires

---

6 In fact, even experienced international experts disagree on some cases.
considerably more dedication to planning of workshops, and for local trainers to use new
techniques but is likely to be reflected in much better results in both the sort and long term.

4.3 Protection – Services to victims

Services available to victims are relatively limited to date but are likely to improve. The Centre for Human Rights Development and several other NGOs provide legal support, and some basic counselling assistance is available. As noted above, any claims by victims for compensation cannot cover emotional damage which greatly limits the potential value they can get from taking legal action, particularly as those who benefit the most from this crime are often at destination points in other countries, outside the jurisdiction of Mongolia.

It is not clear at this stage that shelter-based care is necessary or appropriate for victims of trafficking, and there does not seem to be an immediate need to add to existing shelters. Twenty-nine shelters exist for children in difficult circumstances in Mongolia, five of which are run by the Government. There is also a women’s shelter for victims of violence and this could provide services for victims of trafficking.

While TA4364 is not directly working on support for victims, this area is nonetheless highly relevant to the Project’s work for a number of reasons. First, the prompt identification and appropriate treatment of victims is fundamental to an appropriate criminal justice response. Without means of identifying victims, including services which encourage victims to come forward and to testify, Police and other law enforcement officials will be unable to apprehend and prosecute traffickers.

Second, information from victims is essential if prevention programmes, including awareness raising programmes, are to be accurately developed and targeted. As noted above, many resources have been wasted in other countries due to awareness raising messages based on an inaccurate understanding of the local situation.

Third, again as noted above, messages need to provide information about how to access assistance if a migration experience goes wrong. Thus, some kind of system needs to be in place to offer this assistance.

It is again important therefore that the Project team participates in activities to share information with other agencies working on trafficking, including those providing direct support to victims.

4.4 Policy, Coordination and Cooperation

Despite the limited number of anti-trafficking activities and players in Mongolia, there is already evidence of duplication and overlap in some areas. During the mission, for example, two training workshops were held with international resource people on similar topics on the same days. Several of the NGOs in the ECPAT network also appeared unaware of the inter-agency working groups mentioned above. Responsibility for coordination within the government lies in the Ministry of Social Welfare but is part of a wider portfolio managed by a single desk.

Policy-wise, Mongolia appears somewhat unsure as to how to handle the issue of a growing sex trade. How policy in this area evolves will have a significant impact on anti-trafficking work (and even more on HIV work) and it is to be hoped that international pressure does not play a major role in promoting solutions that are unsuitable for local realities. From a trafficking point of view, it is vital that distinctions are made between forced and child prostitution and non-forced adult prostitution. Without such distinctions, there becomes a positive incentive for owners of entertainment venues to use trafficked women and girls on the basis of cost.
Further, while there was some discussion among NGOs at a recent meeting about how to encourage women engaged in non-forced prostitution to stop, this was closely followed by another discussion on the lack of resources available to help victims of trafficking. There is clearly a need to prioritise assistance to children and to women who are trafficked.

4.5 Suggested Imperatives for Mongolia

Although, as noted at the outset, this report is primarily focused on issues which directly affect TA4364, it is still possible to identify some important priorities for the anti-trafficking response in Mongolia. A list of these priorities, which is by no means exhaustive, is included below, with a view to helping inform any advocacy work being undertaken by the Project.

- Ensuring that materials used in awareness raising are pre-tested with sample of target group and that awareness raising campaigns include a monitoring component as a matter of course, to measure their effectiveness;
- Implement a range of measures to combat false advertising including counter advertisements and ‘hassling’ of advertisers
- Proceed with plans to ratify the UN Convention on Transnational Organised Crime and accompanying Protocols on Trafficking and Smuggling;
- Develop a clear plan for strengthening of the national law enforcement/criminal justice response, with clear markers of progress. The number of successful prosecutions should be included as a marker but not over-emphasised as the focus should be on targeting the bigger players;
- Strengthen the legal framework, including procedures as well as laws;
- Consider the possibility of establishing a small, specialist unit with the Police to combat trafficking and sexual exploitation, in line with good international practice;
- Develop a basic reintegration ‘package’ of assistance which should be available to all victims of trafficking, and work towards achieving this. As part of this process, a baseline should be established of services currently available and their geographical coverage;
- Develop a referral system between agencies so that victims can access the full range of available services;
- Establish a 24-hour freecall hotline as a one-stop number for reporting trafficking cases or suspected trafficking cases, and for information for potential migrants. This should be linked to the referral system. The hotline number should be included in all awareness-raising materials.
- Develop cooperation mechanisms with major destination countries;
- Develop effective coordination mechanisms including an email list-serve with information on upcoming events such as training workshops and a mapping of activities, updated on a regular basis;
- Develop agreed quality assurance mechanisms for training programmes including agreement on the criteria for training to be classified as ‘TOT’.

5. Issues for TA 4364

A number of issues will need to be taken into account in developing activities under TA4364. The trafficking-related components primarily concern two types of activities, training and awareness raising. Work under these areas globally has generally been unimpressive and inefficient, being characterised by poorly-defined objectives, overlap and duplication, and limited follow-up. It is important that the Project avoid these traps. Key issues are highlighted below.
5.1 Potential Impact of the Road Project

All those spoken to agree that the completion of the road will bring significant economic benefit to Mongolia. There are accompanying concerns though of potential negative impact. The increased flow of traffic through the country has already led to an increase in accidents (an issue addressed in another TA project), and experience from elsewhere suggests that the increased population movement (and increased demand for the sex trade generated by road workers and then potentially road users) will likely have a negative impact on HIV and other STIs, particularly with high existing STI prevalence in the country, among both sex workers and the wider population.7

The potential impact on trafficking is less clear at this point. On the one hand, the road will provide the possibility of new economic opportunities which may provide alternatives to migration. On the other hand, communities that where previously remote will be more accessible to all, including traffickers. Further, previous road projects led to a number of marriages between the workers and local women, and the existence of trafficking through false marriage means there is an issue that cannot be overlooked.

There is, in any case, a clear need for trafficking prevention activities in the areas covered by the road and the Project TA4364 provides the opportunity to combine trafficking prevention activities with HIV prevention in a systematic manner, something which has not been done before under an ADB Project, and rarely been done under any project. An example of the benefits of a consolidated approach is the use of peer education techniques for sex workers, which is increasingly common in HIV work, but is often neglected with respect to trafficking. HIV work also provides access to clients of sex workers.

It will also be important for the Project to consider potential growth of child sex tourism as myths about the healing properties of having sex with virgins and the spread of HIV continue to add to international demand for younger and younger victims.

Work with the border officials and Police will complement the above prevention activities in making trafficking and more risky, and therefore less attractive activity for criminal groups.

5.2 Training Activities already planned

A number of trainings have already taken place in Mongolia including some training with border officials and Police in Darkhan, near the northern border. Training has also been run for vulnerable groups at Dornod in the East.

Several other training activities are being planned. Specifically, the Ministry of Social Welfare, with UNICEF support has run a training of State Officials and has been planning similar training with the Police and Border officials. The Project needs to continue work closely with these agencies to ensure most effective use of resources.

A second consideration is that the training supported by the Project will be of a one-off nature. Close cooperation with others is an important strategy to ensure future activities build on this training. (Another particularly important strategy is to ensure that local Project staff have the opportunity to build their trafficking-specific training skills, ensuring that they will continue to be an important training resource for the Mongolian anti-trafficking response in the future).

Initial thoughts had involved training the Police and Border Guards together but separate trainings would be more appropriate for two reasons. It would fit in better with pre-existing

---

7 The Vice Minister of Health informed the team that STI prevalence among adults 18-45 was around 1-3, and 70% among sex workers,
Government plans and the training matter for Police and Border Officials will be somewhat different.

### 5.3 Working with the Police

Several Police have expressed the desire for specialist scenario-based anti-trafficking training. While such training would be very useful, doing this properly requires highly specialised Police trainers and a course of two weeks or so in duration. It is therefore more realistic for the TA4364 training to focus on assisting the Police to improve their understanding of how to combat this crime, while laying the groundwork for future more specialised efforts.

Training of Police should therefore involve:

- How trafficking is defined and how to distinguish it from smuggling and/or prostitution;
- The role of the criminal justice system in combating trafficking;
- The importance of appropriate treatment of victims, including issues of privacy;
- Which laws can be used to apprehend perpetrators; and
- An introduction to disruption techniques.

While the Project team is more than capable of overseeing training of this nature, the Anti-Trafficking Expert is in discussions with a Project in South-East Asia which provides training to several South-East Asian countries as well as the Australian Police. UNICEF has agreed to fund airfares and accommodation for the trainer and the Project is now looking to see whether it can release one of its staff on a no-fee basis. This would create a hugely valuable link for the Mongolian Police.

The possibility of supporting a visit of key Police officials to their counterparts in Beijing is also under consideration. Mongolia will simply be unable to address cross-border trafficking without cross cooperation with China. A well-planned visit to China could lead to major advances in this issue, particularly through the creation of personal linkages. Issues for discussion would include methods of intelligence sharing (Mongolia reportedly relies considerably on Interpol at present which is much too slow for anti-trafficking purposes), and an explanation of each countries laws which are relevant to trafficking. Representatives from Border Guards and Ministry of Foreign Affairs should also be included in any initial cross-border delegation.

### 5.4 Working with Border Officials

Training of border officials will take place following the Police training. As the potential role and jurisdiction of the border officials is more limited, this training is likely to be more of a dialogue than the Police training, looking at how Border officials can best contribute to the fight against trafficking.

The work with border officials also has two other components. The first involves the provision of computer equipment and the second involves possible meetings with counterparts across the border. With regard to the computer equipment, the next section indicates the importance of such equipment. With regard to possible meetings with counterparts, meetings on other topics already take place on both the Russian and Chinese borders on a regular basis. The Project’s focus should be on the Chinese border in the first instance, as this appears to have the vast majority of trafficking cases.
Computerised Border Management System

In the past, the role of border officials in combating trafficking has involved trying to make it more difficult for those perceived to be at risk to cross borders. **Far from reducing trafficking, this has often led potentially migrants to resort to more clandestine and risky methods of crossing the border.** As noted above, because the exploitation that constitutes trafficking usually only becomes apparent at destination, it is very difficult to identify cases at the border. Any moves to tighten border controls such as by reintroducing visa requirements to China, would be likely to cause significant disruption to the general public, with little evidence that its affect on trafficking would be positive. Moreover, moves to restrict movement again distract from the core element of the trafficking offence which is the exploitation involved.

However, there are a number of things which can be done. Closer scrutiny of children crossing the border with people who are not their parents is one example and Mongolia has acted quickly to change their emigration forms to make these cases more apparent. Flagging of those suspected of being involved in criminal activity is another technique. This is greatly enhanced by having a computerised system. Border officials told the TA4364 team that they currently had to try and memorise 300 names and faces!

### Case Study on Importance of Computer-based system

The other major benefit of a computerised system would be in the identification of migrants who had not returned and with whom they crossed the border. During the mission, the Project team was approached by an NGO for advice on what they could do in the case of a 17-year-old girl who went to China in November 2005 in a minibus full of Chinese citizens and hasn’t been heard from since. Given the size of China, there is not so much that can be done. However, a computerised immigration system will allow cross-referencing of those who crossed the border in the same vehicle to see whether any of them are returning to Mongolia on a regular basis and any other relevant details (such as that they always return to China with young Mongolian women). This may or may not lead to progress in any particular case but is one of the few options for addressing this problem.\(^8\)

Two other actions should arise from this case. The first is the development of a register of missing persons. Trafficking victims returning in the future should be asked to review this register to see whether they recognise any of these people. The second is that the mother of the victim apparently called more than a dozen agencies to seek help only to be continually referred on to another. A one-stop contact point and referral service is urgently needed in Mongolia for trafficking and sexual exploitation.

With regard to equipment, UNICEF has already indicated it will be providing some computers and again there will be a need to work together to ensure compatibility in equipment, appropriate provision of equipment and training.

5.5 Development of Awareness Raising Materials

As noted in Section 4.1, there are a number of key points to consider when developing awareness raising materials. These include:

- the need to accurately reflect the local situation;
- the need to be consistent with the experiences of the target group;
- the need to complement and be consistent with other anti-trafficking

\(^8\) A small group will be asked to review this case during the Police training workshop and identify any other possible courses of action.
messages being delivered to the target group;
• the need to include information on how to access assistance; and
• the importance of monitoring the effects of awareness-raising programmes
  (perhaps the most neglected aspect of anti-trafficking activities throughout
  Asia).

With this in mind, the Project proposes to take a three-pronged approach to developing and
delivering anti-trafficking messages. This will involve:

1. Cooperating with other agencies on materials development using a range of
different media;
2. Integrating trafficking messages into HIV prevention materials as appropriate;
   and
3. Using the TOT prevention workshop and follow-up workshops to generate
   new materials through asking participants to develop and design their own.
   The best materials will be considered for reproduction and distribution.

The baseline survey and follow-up will include key questions relating to trafficking to
measure any changes in awareness. The Project team will also liaise with agencies working
with returned victims to identify their pre-existing knowledge of trafficking and modify any
messages accordingly.

5.6 Monitoring and Evaluation

A Monitoring and Evaluation Plan is being developed to cover all aspects of the Project.
Given that it is not possible to use the number of trafficking cases as an indicator, other
methods of measuring project progress and achievements will need to be developed. An
emphasis will be placed on quality of project outputs, rather than quantity.

Key Monitoring and Evaluation activities relating to the anti-trafficking components will
include:

• Inclusion of trafficking questions in the baseline and follow-up surveys to
  measure existing understanding and changes to this understanding over time;
• Pre and post-test questionnaires for training workshops;
• Evaluation forms for training workshops;
• Regular ongoing dialogue with key partners to identify any changes resulting
  from Project activities (most significant change monitoring).

5.7 Sustainability

During the initial project mission, concerns were expressed in a number of quarters as to
addition, as mentioned earlier, an important strategy is to ensure that local Project staff have
the opportunity to build their trafficking-specific training skills, ensuring that they will continue
to be an important training resource for the Mongolian anti-trafficking response in the future.
Unfortunately, the timing of the formal recruitment of these local staff limited the opportunity
for the external adviser to work closely with them until the last week of his visit but further
discussions will continue via email and phone and the Project will also seek to identify any
other possible relevant training opportunities for the staff.
Annex D: Final Report on Human Trafficking

ADB TA4364: MONGOLIA

Awareness and Prevention of HIV/AIDS and Human Trafficking on the North-south Road Corridor

Final Report on Trafficking Consultancy

September 2007

Final
Table of Contents

1 Introduction ............................................................................................................3
2 Executive Summary ...............................................................................................4
3 Overview of Trafficking Situation in Mongolia ........................................................7
   Main Routes and Trends ...................................................................................7
   Techniques of traffickers ................................................................................8
   Who is vulnerable to being trafficked? ...........................................................9
4 Overview of Responses in Mongolia to date .........................................................10
   4.1 Awareness Raising/Communication Materials ............................................11
       Mass Media ............................................................................................11
       Interactive Techniques ...........................................................................12
   4.2 Prosecution/Criminal Justice Responses ....................................................13
   4.3 Cooperation with China ...............................................................................15
   4.4 Coordination ................................................................................................16
5 Priorities for the Future ........................................................................................16
   5.1 Future possibilities for ADB ..........................................................................18
       Building on existing activities .................................................................18
Annex 1: Brief Notes on Third Mission to Mongolia, 6 – 16 June 2007 ...............24
Annex 2: Note on Meeting with Ministry of Foreign Affairs .................................27
1. Introduction

This report has been written following the third and final mission of the anti human-trafficking consultant for project TA4364. It is not a completion report as the overall Project, including some trafficking activities, is ongoing.

The report comprises three main sections. The first updates the situational analysis report prepared in May 2006. This reflects the fact that human trafficking is a new issue for Mongolia and new information is appearing all the time. There have also been significant developments in terms of Mongolia’s response to the problem.

The second section describes the activities and achievements of TA4364’s work related directly or indirectly to human trafficking. In doing so, it highlights a number of innovative aspects of the Project’s work. The third section provides a brief overview of the priorities for combating trafficking in Mongolia, highlights the major players and reviews opportunities and options for future assistance. Most of the issues covered in the third mission are incorporated in the three sections above. However, a very brief trip overview is included as Annex 1.

In order to ensure this report can be read as a stand-alone, there is some duplication of the Situational Analysis and subsequent Communications Strategy. The report also assumes some existing knowledge of human trafficking. General introductory information on trafficking can be found in another ADB Report: Preventing the Trafficking of Women and Children and Promoting Safe Migration in the Greater Mekong Sub-region produced in August 2005 under ADB Project RETA 6190. A comprehensive guide on trafficking and how to combat it will be released by the same project in late 2007.

About Project TA 4364

ADB is supporting a Regional Road Development Project which will develop the remaining section of Mongolia’s north-south road transport corridor between Choyr and Zamyn-Uud on the border with the People’s Republic of China (PRC). Once completed, this road will link the Asian highway networks of the PRC and the Russian Federation (Russia).

As well as the road building itself, the Project included:

1. A cross-border transport facilitation plan;
2. Road safety improvement;
3. Area development to maximise the poverty reduction impact of the Project; and
4. **Technical Assistance (TA4364) for awareness and prevention of HIV/AIDS and human trafficking on the north-south road corridor.**

In developing the Regional Road Development Project, it was recognised that the construction of the road, while bringing many positive benefits may also potentially increase the spread of HIV/AIDS and other STIs, as well as exposing an increased number of people to the risks of human trafficking.

Project TA4364 aimed to mitigate these risks through a series of inter-related activities involving awareness raising; peer education with vulnerable populations; and strengthening border control capacity against human trafficking. The Project offered a rare opportunity to combine trafficking prevention activities with HIV/AIDS prevention activities, due to the fact that the target groups for these activities inevitably overlap.

Structurally, however, TA4364 is not located under the Regional Road Development Project but the Health Sector Development Programme Two (HSDP-2). This makes sense in terms of the type of activities being undertaken, although appears to have led to a degree of
uncertainty between the two larger Projects as to where exactly the project belongs, which has led to some minor administrative issues. Of greater impact on the activities of TA4364, however, has been delays in starting work on some parts of the road. Work on the middle section of the road, for example, only commenced in April 2007. As a result, the key target groups for TA4364 have not been present for a large part of the TA. Labourers only just began to arrive in mid-2007 and there is not as yet a significant prostitution trade associated with the construction.

2. Executive Summary

Trafficking is a relatively recent phenomenon in Mongolia and new information is emerging all the time. Since TA4364 commenced in early 2006, knowledge of the problem has increased considerably. There appears growing awareness within both government circles and the general population.

No reliable estimates are available on the size of the problem. However, all those consulted during the third mission – government and otherwise expressed the view that the problem was considerably greater than had previously been understood. New trafficking patterns appear to be emerging on a disconcertingly regular basis.

A year ago, the main trafficking pattern appeared to be trafficking of women and girls for sexual exploitation in China (particularly Macau and Beijing). Trafficking also occurred for forced labour under false marriage. In addition, the large amount of migrant labour from Mongolia to countries known as destination points for trafficking suggested that this area warranted further investigation. Rumours also persisted of trafficking for organs but, a year on, there has been no confirmed cases and indeed stories of such trafficking have been very difficult to substantiate throughout Asia.

New trends have emerged within the last year. For example, the involvement of Mongolian women in prostitution in Erlian, just over the border from Zamyn-Uud in the south, was thought to be largely voluntary. However, there are increasing reports that women are being deceived into debt bondage arrangements. This has significant implications for TA4364 given its location and the Project Coordinator recently held an informal training session on HIV and trafficking. (This was very successful and is reported on in the main section of the report).

Mongolia’s response to trafficking is at an early stage and does not yet comprehensively address all aspects of the problem. A National Plan of Action against Sexual Exploitation and Trafficking of Children was approved in late November 2005, accompanied by the formation of five technical working groups to address various priorities in the anti-trafficking response. While this has increased the number of activities in response to trafficking, there appears to be a need for more structure and prioritisation in Mongolia’s response (an observation that could probably be applied to almost all countries on this issue).

Perhaps the biggest constraint facing this response is that, for most trafficking cases involving Mongolians, the worst aspects of the trafficking crime, in terms of exploitation and profit, usually takes place in other countries, outside the jurisdiction of Mongolia. This means that international cooperation will be a key component of any effective response, particularly with China, which is widely regarded as somewhat reluctant on this issue, particularly with regard to distinguishing victims of traffickers from irregular migrants and/or sex workers.

TA4364 is an unusual project in that it seeks to incorporate anti-trafficking activities into a programme focusing primarily on HIV and STI prevention. While there have been other attempts to develop projects along these lines, the trafficking component has reportedly often be seen as an add-on activity leading to limited focus and activities. In the case of TA4364, opportunities were seen to strengthen the trafficking component by including
specific work with law enforcement officials (border guards and police) and ensuring genuine inclusion of trafficking issues and messages throughout project activities.

Detailed training materials have been developed including three TOT manuals. The first is for community educators and covers training techniques, HIV/AIDS prevention and trafficking/safer migration. The second is an introductory guide for police and includes training techniques, identifying trafficking cases, appropriate treatment of victims and use of different techniques to combat traffickers. The manual for border guards is similar, although more targeted to their specific roles of information collection, and potential victim and trafficker identification. These manuals are complemented by reference papers that training participants can take away for future use. These papers cover all aspects of the training.

Now that these materials have been developed, they can be used, not only for expansion of training activities within Mongolia, but also potentially for adaptation in other countries undertaking similar anti-trafficking activities. It should be noted, however, that these are introductory materials aimed at general level law enforcement officials. An Interpol Manual for more specific and advanced training (such as scenario-based investigation training) is already available and is currently being translated into Mongolian by UNICEF.9

The other major activity of TA4364 has been materials development. This is ongoing and has included: production of a video on trafficking; a booklet on HIV and trafficking; and playing cards with information on HIV and trafficking. Additional activities in the pipeline include a dvd specifically for those travelling to China by train, a billboard on the main border crossing point with China, and development of posters encouraging migrants to protect themselves from traffickers.

A key part of the Project’s strategy is close cooperation with other agencies. This is shown in the training programmes, which work closely with existing government structures, and in the materials development where the team is working closing with both local NGOs and external donor agencies such as UNICEF and The Asia Foundation.

Indeed, many of the activities planned by the Project overlapped with activities already planned by other agencies. While this provided some early complications and necessitated some modification of Project plans, it also highlighted that the proposed activities were in line with the Government’s top priorities on this issue. While a more cooperative and coordinated approach requires a degree of flexibility with regard to project planning and implementation, it also offers opportunities for increased results, particularly in terms of sustainability of impact after Project activities are completed.

With regard to follow-up, the existence of training manuals and other materials mean that project activities relating to trafficking could be continued and expanded geographically in a cost-effective manner. A proviso is that little is known about trafficking in western Mongolia so that additional information gathering may be required. In addition, some form of ongoing quality control would be appropriate with regard to the TOT including monitoring of trainings and a refresher course for key trainers.

Beyond the continuation of existing activities, the number one priority would appear to be strengthening the criminal justice response through legislative development, specialist investigation skills training and improvement of legal procedures and cooperation. This may not necessarily be seen as within ADB’s gambit.

---

9 Mongolia already has a link with the developers of the latest version of this Manual who work for the Asia Regional Trafficking in Persons Project (ARTIP). This is the same project as Gerard Smith, the Police Adviser who TA4364 worked with UNICEF to bring to the national police training supported by the project.
One activity which took place later than expected was the project baseline. This was due to the late arrival of the construction workers. The baseline is now nearing completion in Mongolian and being translated into English.

3. Overview of Trafficking Situation in Mongolia

Main Routes and Trends

Trafficking is a relatively recent phenomenon in Mongolia and new information is emerging all the time. Since TA4364 commenced in early 2006, knowledge of the problem has increased considerably. There appears growing awareness of trafficking within both government circles and the general population.

No reliable estimates are available on the size of the problem. However, 127 cases were reported in the first half of 2006. As elsewhere, this is likely to be the ‘tip of the iceberg’. Most people working on the issue believe that the problem is much larger than that.

New trafficking patterns appear to be emerging on a disconcertingly regular basis. The Mongolian Gender Equity Center (MGEC) and The Asia Foundation (TAF) joined together in 2006 to undertake research on the problem. The result, ‘Human Trafficking in Mongolia: Risks, Vulnerability and Trauma’ (referred to below as the MGEC research) represents an excellent piece of work and sheds considerable light on the problem, although the information and analysis needs to be assessed discerningly.

A year ago, the main trafficking pattern appeared to be trafficking of women and girls for sexual exploitation in China (particularly Macau and Beijing). The typical arrangement appears to be one of debt bondage, that is, women are ‘sold’ to an entertainment place and then have to work to pay off their debt. In the space of a few days, a research team from Mongolia reportedly found 50 women working in bars in Beijing alone, of whom many were believed to be in debt bondage.

At least some of these women have some freedom of movement but have no easy way to access any assistance. Traffickers use a variety of methods to maintain control over their victims, ranging from direct force to threats to expose their involvement in the sex trade to families and communities.

In some cases, women who pay off this ‘debt’ are then reportedly offered $250 per head to recruit new victims. A combination of issues related to trauma and the fact that they would otherwise have nothing to show for their horrendous experience, leads a number of the victims to take up this offer, thus perpetuating the trafficking cycle. A further benefit for the trafficking networks is that these women are currently the most likely to be caught in anti-trafficking efforts, while those perpetuating the worst abuses remain untouched.

Trafficking has also been reported for forced labour under fake or sham marriage. There have also been rumours of trafficking for organs but there have been no confirmed cases and indeed stories of such trafficking have been very difficult to substantiate throughout Asia.

While Macau, Beijing and Hong Kong may remain the biggest destination points for trafficking, new trends are emerging. These must be treated with caution as there is a tendency in all countries to conflate an individual case with a trend.\footnote{This is seen in the MGEC publication where information on one case of abduction is reported as ‘the MGEC research has also identified a worrisome upward trend in domestic trafficking that includes teenage girls kidnapped off the streets of Ulan Bataar and locked in hotel rooms where they are sexually exploited.’}
For example, the involvement of Mongolian women in prostitution in Erlian, just over the border from Zamyn-Uud in the south, was thought to be largely non-coerced. However, there are increasing reports that women are being deceived into debt bondage arrangements there also. The women take one or two months to pay off the debt and are then invited by the brothel owner to stay on and keep a share of the money they earn. Many women choose this option, which is understandable as otherwise they will return home with nothing to show for their experience, and perhaps facing difficult questions as to where they have been and why they have returned with no money. For the traffickers, this is a clever strategy as it essentially makes the women feel complicit in their experience and greatly lessens the chance of their reporting the traffickers. Many women reportedly end up going back to Erlian after returning home and re-engaging in prostitution due to a lack of options in Mongolia.

In addition, the large amount of migrant labour from Mongolia to countries known as destination points for trafficking suggests that this area warrants further investigation. The MGEC research reported trafficking to Korea – where there are tens of thousands of Mongolian workers – Japan, Singapore, Turkey – which is a destination country for CIS nations – and Eastern European. Internally, there have been some reports of forced labour, together with reports of sexual exploitation of young children working in the markets of Ulaanbaatar. Demand for domestic prostitution appears to be growing, fuelled by a growth in itinerant labour for mining and, potentially, road building. While not all prostitution is trafficking, most people consider it inherently exploitative and it is almost inevitably associated with organised criminal activity, making those involved vulnerable to exploitation and abuse, as well as HIV/AIDS.

Despite the presence of very long land borders with China and Russia, all contacts agree that the borders are very well policed and trafficked victims, like other migrants, invariably travel through official border points. No visa is required for crossing to China, meaning that illegal crossing is unnecessary. There does, however, appear to be a growth in false passports, containing visas for destinations further afield. Trafficking to Russia is not generally thought to be significant, particularly as the parts of Russia closest to Mongolia have very similar economic conditions. This reduces the likelihood of people migrating in search of better work opportunities.

**Techniques of traffickers**

Recruitment of victims is often done through newspaper advertisements often blatantly seeking young attractive women. Sometimes these advertisements are for positions in China, while in others applicants are told they must first travel to China to get a visa for onward travel to another destination. Employment/equality laws do not prevent such advertising in Mongolia at the present time. However, in many countries, advertising based on sex, looks or age is regarded as discrimination and is illegal. If Mongolia took a similar approach, it could make things quite a lot more difficult for traffickers.

The MGEC also reports women and girls being trafficked after being offered the chance to study abroad. A range of options exist for addressing this recruitment practice, although other recruitment methods are more complex.

As noted above, traffickers use a variety of methods to maintain control over their victims, ranging from direct force to threats to expose their involvement in the sex trade to families and communities. They may also attempt to make victims feel complicit in their trafficking experience through inviting them to recruit others or allowing them to stay on once their debts have been paid to earn some money. A significant number of trafficking victims have reportedly been tricked or sold into prostitution by close friends or acquaintances.
Who is vulnerable to being trafficked?

As elsewhere, vulnerability to trafficking is commonly linked with poverty, lack of education and lack of awareness about the risks of trafficking. However, this needs to be looked at critically. It is clear that the wealthiest and most educated members of society are at very low risk of being trafficked. However, as we start to move further down the economic and educational ladder, the picture becomes less clear.

With regard to poverty, those who cannot earn enough money or produce enough food to survive are clearly highly vulnerable to the promises of traffickers. However, trafficking is often linked to migration and it is not always the poorest of the poor who migrate. Rather, migration is caused by a range of factors. Often, economic disparity is more important than poverty in absolute terms, which helps to explain why those near borders with richer countries often have high migration rates even though they are economically better off than other parts of the country. While this is borne out by the MGEC study, the apparent determination to link trafficking to poverty has this referred to as a paradox. Similarly, the information used to link education levels to willingness to migrate is somewhat questionable. Awareness of trafficking and the risks of migration are increasing in Mongolia but still appear low. In June 2007 there was a major rock concert involving many of Mongolia’s leading bands. This was extremely well attended but it was clear that the concept of trafficking and the terminology was unfamiliar to many of the young people who spoke. The MGEC research also notes that ‘not all victims are ignorant of the risk, but they are characteristically naïve in believing that their circumstance will be the exception.’

The research goes on to add that ‘a dearth of jobs, poverty and a desire to leave Mongolia best explains the conditions that place youth and adults at risk and accurately describes the experience of victims that were interviewed.’ It is clear that these factors are largely outside the control and scope of anti-trafficking programmes, particularly when poverty is viewed more accurately as relative poverty or economic disparity. Even if incomes increase in Mongolia, it is unlikely that this will do much to close the gap between the incomes available in Mongolia and foreign destinations.

This highlights the importance of measures to make migration more safe both by better equipping potential migrants to protect themselves and making life more difficult for traffickers.

4. Overview of Responses in Mongolia to date

In overall terms, the response to trafficking in Mongolia is at a nascent stage. It is characterised by a mixture of standard interventions, inevitable difficulties in distinguishing between trafficking, smuggling and prostitution, notably among law enforcement, and a number of genuinely innovative ideas and interventions which augur well for the future of Mongolia’s anti-trafficking response.

The National Plan of Action on Commercial Sexual Exploitation and Trafficking of Children was approved in late November 2005. It is a significant development and will act as an overarching framework for Mongolia’s national response. The NPA is, in general, a strong first Plan but unfortunately, contains only a partial definition of trafficking, referring only to women and children. This means that the NPA is not fully in step with the international consensus definition of trafficking contained in the UN Trafficking in Persons Protocol. It also contributes to the automatic association of trafficking and the sex trade and facilitates the perception of certain stereotypes about who is trafficked and why.  

---

11 For detailed discussion of this issue, see ARCPPT’s Gender Strategy 1995, available on www.arcppt.org
To assist in implementing the NPA, five inter-agency working groups have been established as follows:

- Training
- Public Awareness
- Research and Monitoring
- Law Reform
- Victim Support

Of these groups, Training and Law Reform have been the most active and TA4364 has worked closely with the government on some aspects of the training programme, which has involved some adjustment to planned activities, notably the separation of training for police and border officials.

As in most countries, the major shortcoming with the NPA as a policy tool is that it seeks to provide a comprehensive rather than strategic response to the problem. While trafficking does indeed require multi-sectoral action and it is important to encourage a range of different activities, there also needs to be a prioritisation of activities in terms of which will make the most impact. In Mongolia, despite many activities being implemented, there remain obvious gaps in the national response. For example, although many victims have been identified, there was not been a single prosecution of a trafficker arising from those cases in 2006. Also, although it should be extremely easy and cheap to impede one of the main recruiting mechanisms of traffickers, advertising in newspapers and magazines, few steps have been taken in this regard.

One important recent development is the establishment of a migration/trafficking helpline in Mongolia. The hotline is receiving an increasing number of calls and is revealing increasing knowledge about the realities of migration. The number, 1903, can now be routinely included on awareness raising materials. In fact since this report was initially drafted the police themselves have called the hotline seeking information on how to deal with a particular case.

Another significant development has been the arrival of the International Organization for Migration (IOM) as a donor on trafficking in Mongolia. IOM specialises in programmes for the return and reintegration of trafficking victims, an area that has been limited in Mongolia to date. The major donors on trafficking are UNICEF and The Asia Foundation. ILO, Save the Children and World Vision are also involved to some extent. ECPAT has established a network of 30 local organisations working on issues relating to child sexual exploitation and trafficking.

As a sending country, it needs to be recognised that there is a limited amount that Mongolia will be able to achieve without cooperation from the places and countries of destination. The prompt identification of victims, their appropriate treatment and the apprehension of those at the end of the exploitative trafficking chain are all fundamental to an effective response to trafficking. Much of this will inevitably remain outside of Mongolia's control and strong international cooperation will be required. At the same time, there is more that could be done in Mongolia with regard to trafficking within its borders.

More details of Mongolia's response to trafficking are provided in the Situational Analysis. The sections below specifically cover work which relates to the activities of TA4364. More information on the approach taken in the development of these activities is contained in the Communication Strategy produced in September 2006.
4.1 Awareness Raising/Communication Materials

Mass Media

A number of awareness raising activities have been undertaken in Mongolia by a range of different organisations. These include production of radio programmes, posters and leaflets. Project TA 4364 has developed its own anti-trafficking video to be shown in training programmes as well as on television. The Project has also developed a booklet which combines HIV and trafficking prevention methods and is also working on incorporating similar messages in a pack of playing cards, an efficient and cost-effective method of reaching a very wide audience as playing cards is a very popular pastime in Mongolia.

Two other awareness raising activities in progress are poster and billboard development. Discussions are ongoing but the Team's current thinking is to focus the poster campaign on those going to China, locating posters on railway platforms and trains in particular. This could be complemented by a short video which could be shown in between the movies that are shown on the train. The message will focus on steps taken to prepare for migration, possibly using a Mongolian acronym which translates as STOP. These steps will encourage migrants to: find more information about the broker they are going with, find more information about the destination and leave details with a friend or relative, obtain and memorise the details of the nearest Embassy/consulate and report cases of trafficking to the authorities and an NGO.

The exact format of the billboard at the southern border is yet to be finalised but will move away from the initial idea provided by MGEC focusing in major detail on the definition of trafficking. As well as MGEC, TAF and UNICEF have expressed a strong interest in collaborating with TA4364 on awareness raising materials, particularly the billboard. This has been strongly welcomed by the project team and discussions are ongoing.

TAF has highlighted the importance of avoiding the potential for confusion caused by different campaigns. It has been a major player in this area, working with MGEC and a local students group. Their activities include a major anti-trafficking campaign involving posters, a booklet and a concert in Ulaanbaatar (see above). The campaign seeks to raise awareness about trafficking with the message – Trafficking: Nobody; Never; Nowhere. TAF is also now working on inserts to be placed in the passports of those crossing the border. It is also looking at developing programmes in schools.

RETA 4364 ideas clearly complement those of others and working together offers the potential for more impact with limited resources. More discussions will, however, be needed on this.

Interactive Techniques

As detailed in the Communications Strategy, one-way mass media techniques are important but limited in responding to both trafficking and HIV/AIDS. A key aspect of the project is the use of interactive techniques such as peer education. Peer education among vulnerable populations has been widely used in the response to HIV/AIDS but is almost unheard of with regard to trafficking prevention throughout the world. TA4364 therefore provides the opportunity to explore the use of these peer education techniques as an overlooked strategy in the fight against trafficking. With regard to sex workers, this also allows a more holistic approach to the risks inherent in the sex trade, educating young women about the risks of trafficking and migration, alongside HIV and other sexually transmitted infections. **The need for this type of more holistic approach to vulnerability is an emerging issue in the trafficking prevention sector and was one of the main points of discussion at an ADB workshop in Manila in late July, which reviewed experience in preventing trafficking over the past few years.** The Mongolia Project Coordinator's presentation to this workshop...
was extremely well received and the successful combination of trafficking and HIV prevention activities attracted considerable interest among both ADB and non-ADB participants.

The first part of this strategy is to provide training to multi-disciplinary teams in aimags along the north-south corridor. This has proceeded as planned. Aimag teams are now working with local educators who will in turn work in training peer educators. The training manual for the aimag and local educators is now complete and thought is being given to tools to be provided to peer educators.

The actual peer education component has been affected by the delays in starting construction on some parts of the road, meaning that neither road workers or sex workers have arrived in significant numbers to date. The other priority at this point is for a refresher training to ensure that the training previously provided by TA4364 is being passed on accurately.

In the meantime, the Project Coordinator was able to draw on contacts developed under the project to run an informal training session for sex workers in Erlian. Although initially reluctant to meet due to the publication by Mongolian health officials of some poorly disguised photos from a previous training, twelve young women eventually turned up and were extremely interested in both the HIV education and the TIP component which was run by the director of the MGEC. The women took the materials for distribution and have maintained contact with the Project Coordinator through email. They reported that they are sharing the information received with their friends.

The development of such contacts offers of course the opportunity not just for assisting the women to protect themselves from HIV/STIs and trafficking but also a rich source of information in a key transit and destination area that can be used to improve future programming. It is important to add that this progress owes much to the personal skills of the Project Coordinator, and any replicability in other areas or countries would be contingent on similarly qualified and dedicated staff being recruited.

4.2 Prosecution/Criminal Justice Responses

As noted above, there were no successful prosecutions of traffickers in 2006. However, several cases are now in the system, and it appears that the training provided by TA4364 is at least partly responsible for this.

Prosecution efforts remain hampered by the paucity of victims filing police complaints, as well as by the fact that State prosecutors do not pursue some cases presented to them by the police. General awareness of the issue among police throughout the country remains low in overall terms. Although the Ministry of Justice, which is responsible for police and border officials, is enthusiastic in its response to this problem, efforts are currently piecemeal with no apparent long-term strategy. The key steps that need to be taken on this issue include:

1. Strengthening of the legal framework around trafficking
2. Development of specialist investigation expertise on trafficking
3. Basic training on trafficking for front-line officials (police, border guards)
4. Training for prosecutors and judges
5. Strengthened cooperation on law enforcement/prosecution between all concerned parties in Mongolia
6. Strengthened international cooperation, particularly with China.
Of these steps, progress has really only been made on point three, with some discussion on points one and six. Initially, TA4364 was to have limited involvement with police, providing training to them only as part of work with border officials. However, in order to fit with the Government’s National Plan of Action, the Team adjusted the schedule to work together on a Police-specific TOT training and follow-up with training at provincial level.

A full report on the TOT course is included in the report on the second mission. Three police trainings have been undertaken since the last mission. Two were run by local authorities in Sainshand aimag following their attendance at the police TOT course supported by TA4364. One course was run in Choyr by TA4364 trainers as the local authorities thought they did not yet have sufficient expertise to do so.

These trainings have helped significantly to progress point three above, at least within the project’s geographical focus, and will be supplemented by training to be done specifically with border officials, to be held in Zamyn-Uud in mid-July. TA4364 is also providing some equipment to Zamyn-Uud in the form of computers to facilitate immigration processing.

More work is needed on the remaining points, however. TAF and UNICEF are working with the Ministry of Justice and others on strengthening of the legal framework12 while TAF and MOJ have also been discussing cooperation with China. This is an area that also falls under TA4364 and is discussed in the next section.

A clear priority in this area is the development of some specialist investigative capacity on human trafficking. UNICEF is supporting the translation of four key anti-trafficking documents, one of which is the revised Interpol Investigative Manual on Trafficking. This original Manual was written by the Senior Technical Adviser for ARTIP, a regional project on law enforcement against trafficking in South-East Asia, based in Bangkok. This project, formerly known as ARCPPT, is also responsible for the Manual’s revision. Gerard Smith, whom TA4364 worked with UNICEF to bring to the police training in August 2007 is a member of the same project team.

As noted it seems that there is a lack of clear strategy in the criminal justice area. Mongolia would benefit from undertaking a comprehensive baseline study, based on the model developed by ARTIP outlining the steps needed to develop an effective criminal justice response to trafficking. This is now being implemented in all ten ASEAN countries. Such a survey would provide a snap-shot of the current situation, assist with prioritisation and ordering of activities, facilitate strengthened coordination of external resources, and provide the basis for monitoring of progress in the future.

4.3 Cooperation with China

During the latest mission, the team met with the Ministry of Justice (which is responsible for police and border guards) and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. There are three different complementary processes in Mongolia and China in relation to human trafficking at this time. These are: consular discussions on a range of topics, including victims of trafficking, a proposed bilateral meeting on law enforcement cooperation, and initial discussions about the possibility of some form of bilateral agreement. However, with the exception of the consular discussions, which are part of an annual process, there does not appear any clarity on the Mongolian side as to what specifically might be involved in these initiatives.

Discussions on the bilateral meeting in particular, revealed a *minestrone* of activities and invitees, with highly technical and centralised issues such as mutual legal assistance blended with operational cooperation at working level, with requires the input of an almost

---

12 The initial situation analysis from 2006 contains a brief analysis of the current legal framework around trafficking.
completely different group of officials. To ensure the greatest benefits from these three processes, Mongolia might consider developing an outline of the kinds of activities it would like to see in a bilateral agreement and then using this to help guide the agenda for the other discussions.

At the meeting with MFA, the Team was requested to provide advice on cooperation with China and prepared an information note that is included as Annex 2. The note highlights the range of areas in which Mongolia might seek to cooperate with China and provides examples from other countries. These include:

- Mutual Legal Assistance and Extradition
- Information/intelligence exchange
- Treatment/protection of victims
- Procedures for assisting and returning victims.
- Joint trainings

Once the Mongolian side becomes a little clearer on its plans for cooperation, the project will be in a better position to assist. With its main focus on cross-border issues, TA4364’s main interest is in promoting cooperation at local levels. With respect to China, this presents two main challenges. One is that China has few mechanisms in place for identifying of trafficking victims and the other is that intelligence-sharing processes are generally highly centralised and therefore potentially too long to be effective in responding to an issue such as trafficking.

With this in mind, one process that is likely to be of considerable interest involves the development of cross-border cooperation between Myanmar and China. The international consultant has requested to be kept informed of developments in this nascent process and will pass these on to the Mongolian authorities.

As well as bilateral cooperation, the meetings with Government included discussion on possible Mongolian involvement as an observer in the forthcoming Inter-Ministerial Meeting in Beijing for the Coordinated Mekong Ministerial Initiative against Trafficking (COMMIT), and MOU between the six Mekong countries. Mongolia will also be invited to participate in a big regional meeting being organised and funded by UNODC in Bangkok, 2-4 October. Both of these offer the opportunity for Mongolia to learn more about responses to trafficking in other countries. If TA4364’s plans to support cross-border dialogue do not come to fruition, consideration might be made to contributing to an extension of the Mongolian delegation’s visit to Bangkok to meet with key resource people in projects there, including ARTIP.

4.4 Coordination

Despite the limited number of anti-trafficking activities and players in Mongolia, there is already evidence of duplication and overlap in some areas. During the second mission, for example, two training workshops were held with international resource people on similar topics on the same days. Additional workshops appear to have been held on the same topics. There does not appear to be a clear plan for the way ahead.

Coordination within the government was initially driven by a single staff member in the Ministry of Social Welfare, who is now studying overseas. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs established a website on trafficking 2-3 years ago with information on anti-trafficking activities. This is now out of date and MFA requested Project assistance in revitalising it. The best way to do so would be to engage a student on a part-time basis to collect and maintain the necessary information.

5. Priorities for the Future

This section aims primarily to explore opportunities for possible continuation of TA4364’s work into a new phase. In doing so, it begins with an overview of the priorities for the anti-
trafficking sector as a whole, before looking at where TA4364 fits. This will avoid the trap fallen into by many programmes of trying to look at the problem from the ‘inside-out’.

The following table looks at priorities identified in 2006 and compares these to the current situation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Progress</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring that materials used in awareness raising are pre-tested with</td>
<td>Good progress appears to have been made on this issue to date with the caveat that <strong>most activities are focusing on the Eastern part of the country, with only UNICEF beginning activities in the West, focusing on child protection issues in general.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sample of target group and that awareness raising campaigns include a</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>monitoring component as a matter of course, to measure their</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>effectiveness.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implement a range of measures to combat false advertising including</td>
<td>Although TAF supported a counter-advertising campaigning and the police have made some attempts to follow-up, this remains an area where much more could be done. Simply outlawing discriminatory advertising, as elsewhere would likely have a major impact on the operation of trafficking networks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>counter advertisements and ‘hassling’ of advertisers.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proceed with plans to ratify the UN Convention on Transnational</td>
<td>This is in progress. Some of those involved consider that Mongolia should ratify the instruments soon while others think that adjustments should be made to the legal framework in advance of this.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organised Crime and accompanying Protocols on Trafficking and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smuggling.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a clear plan for strengthening of the national law</td>
<td>This remains a high priority and the international consultant held some discussions with TAF as to how this might be supported, although many of the activities involved in this area are outside the realm of the TA4364 project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enforcement/criminal justice response, with clear markers of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>progress. The number of successful prosecutions should be included</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>as a marker but not over-emphasised as the focus should be on</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>targeting the bigger players.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen the legal framework, including procedures as well as laws.</td>
<td>Several organisations are involved in work on this.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider the possibility of establishing a small, specialist unit</td>
<td>This needs to be considered as part of a wider plan described two boxes above.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with the Police to combat trafficking and sexual exploitation, in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>line with good international practice.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a basic reintegration ‘package’ of assistance which should</td>
<td>The new IOM project will support work on this issue and fill an important gap in the anti-trafficking response. There are at present no plans to develop the type of baseline mentioned, however.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be available to all victims of trafficking, and work towards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>achieving this. As part of this process, a baseline should be</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>established of services currently available and their geographical</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>coverage.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a referral system between agencies so that victims can access</td>
<td>Through ECPAT there are already good linkages between those working with victims and IOM’s project should help to improve the focus of these efforts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the full range of available services.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Establish a 24-hour freecall hotline as a one-stop number for reporting trafficking cases or suspected trafficking cases, and for information for potential migrants. This should be linked to the referral system. The hotline number should be included in all awareness-raising materials.

This is one of the major advances in the past twelve months with establishment of a national phoneline on trafficking. The number of calls to this line is increasing steadily and all new awareness raising materials viewed include this number.

Develop cooperation mechanisms with major destination countries.

Work with China is a priority and initial discussions have commenced. This has been discussed in more detail above.

Develop effective coordination mechanisms including an email list-serve with information on upcoming events such as training workshops and a mapping of activities, updated on a regular basis.

Little progress has been made on this to date and it remains a priority so that the relatively limited resources are allocated in the most effective manner. As noted, this could probably be done by a student employed on a part-time basis.

5.1 Future possibilities for ADB

Building on existing activities

TA4364 activities relating to trafficking fit into the following categories:

1. Production of materials for awareness raising
2. Behaviour change communication/peer education
3. Basic-level training of front-line police
4. Training and support for border officials
5. Initial support for bilateral/cross-border cooperation with China

These activities can be built on in two ways. The first reinforces and strengthens work in or near existing areas of geographic focus along the north-south corridor.

The second would involve geographical expansion. Building on the present project which predominantly focuses on the south-eastern part of the north-south corridor, this could include the northern part of this road to the border with Russia, and expansion to the east, which could link with the proposed new east-west road development. The following table sets out options in each of these categories.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>In existing areas</th>
<th>Geographic Expansion</th>
<th>Partners</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Production of materials for awareness raising</td>
<td>One the current materials are produced, it is likely that there will be limited need for new materials in the same geographic areas, particularly with other agencies working on this also.</td>
<td>Some of the materials being developed will be applicable throughout Mongolia but some new materials may be needed to address different situations in other parts of the country, particularly if there is domestic trafficking, or trafficking through western border points.</td>
<td>UNICEF (esp. western aimags), MGEC, TAF, local aimag teams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behaviour change communication/peer education</td>
<td>To ensure quality controls, refresher training and monitoring of training activities implemented by aimag teams is a priority. Continuation of work with sex workers based on recently developed links should also be a priority</td>
<td>The types of techniques being developed by TA4364 combining HIV and trafficking education are potentially sustainable and could readily be adapted to other geographic areas</td>
<td>aimag teams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic-level training of frontline police</td>
<td>Again, refresher training and monitoring of training activities implemented at aimag level is a priority. Ideally, specialised scenario-based investigation training could be included although this starts to move away from the original intention of the project. It is also a specialised area so would require dedicated external expertise. Much more could be done with police and this is described below.</td>
<td>TA4364 has now developed extremely detailed training materials which could be used throughout the country to provide basic level training to police. Information from partners suggests that knowledge of trafficking among law enforcement officials in other parts of the country remains extremely low or non-existent.</td>
<td>Ministry of Justice (specifically Police Dept), TAF, UNICEF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and support for border officials</td>
<td>Initial training is being provided to border officials. There is considerable scope for follow-up training in this area. There is also scope for developing a more comprehensive assistance package including strengthened IT and case management networks. This again is a specialist technical area and would need different expertise than that held by the team.</td>
<td>Again, the project has materials which could be used throughout the country. However, the high priority at this stage appears to be the border with China. More information (see point 6) is needed on other parts of the country.</td>
<td>Ministry of Justice (specifically Border Guards Dept)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>In existing areas</td>
<td>Geographic Expansion</td>
<td>Partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial support for bilateral/cross-border cooperation with China</td>
<td>At the present time there is much to do with regard to cooperation at central levels and on the Zamyn-Uud border. Discussions are only just beginning and working with China on trafficking (and HIV) is regarded as challenging by all parties. Links should be maintained with ARTIP which is facilitating a similar process between China and Myanmar, where discussions are more advanced.</td>
<td>At this stage China appears the strong priority. After China, the top priority would appear to be Korea – where there are reportedly close to 100,000 Mongolian workers. Russia appears a lower priority while nearby Kazakhstan is an unknown, albeit with some rumours of exploitative practices involving Kazakh populations in the West.</td>
<td>Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, ARTIP. TAF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research and Evaluation</td>
<td>Follow-up to all activities will be need with a focus on the baseline.</td>
<td>As noted, little information is available on trafficking issues in the western part of the country. Some research might be needed to inform activities.</td>
<td>MGEC, UNICEF</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
An Expanded Project?

In the new guide to trafficking being developed by ADB RETA6190, strong emphasis is being placed on the need to treat vulnerability as a holistic concept. This means looking at issues more broadly than traditional approaches which focus primarily on poverty in economic terms, and also in looking at vulnerability to a range of different problems, rather than just, for example, through the lens of HIV. An obvious example relating to road development is road safety. Indications from TA4364 and RETA6190 are that the most immediate negative impact of new roads is a significant number of accidents, deaths and injuries. An issue such as trafficking by contrast may manifest itself more in the longer term. Vulnerability to HIV has both immediate concerns, with the impact of workers involved in road-building, and longer-term impacts relating to greater exposure of rural communities to outsiders and potentially increased migration.

Work on one or more of these issues can often be combined. As noted above, TA4364’s work to consider HIV and trafficking together as potential risks faced by vulnerable groups is in line with latest thinking and work could be expanded to incorporate road safety and other key issues. Sometimes this might involve issues that are not directly affected by the road but can be addressed opportunistically – for example, nutrition.

Beyond this, work to combine HIV and trafficking is somewhat complicated by the difference in institutional capacity in responding to the two issues. In terms of HIV/AIDS, National Committee on AIDS Prevention was re-established under the supervision of the Deputy Prime Minister in 2006 and National Strategy on HIV and AIDS Prevention (2006-2010) was adopted. MOH and National Centre for Health Development (NCHD) are main government organizations, responsible for implementing and monitoring National Plan of Action on HIV/AIDS. Major donors for HIV/AIDS response in Mongolia are Global Fund on HIV/AIDS and TB (round 2 and 5) and UN Organizations. UN Theme Group, founded in 2006 (chaired by UNFPA/WHO) now making efforts in advocacy and awareness raising on HIV/AIDS, National Coordination activities such as National Seminar on HIV/AIDS, promotion of youth and adolescent education through secondary schools, public awareness raising on World AIDS Day, organization of community outreach and mass media programs, undertaken in different settings.

In contrast, the TA4364 team is not aware of anybody who works full time on the trafficking issue in Mongolia. Partly for this region, there does not appear to be any strategic planning in the sector. This is particularly noticeable with regard to the law enforcement area, and also in terms of broader coordination in the sector.

Any work combining HIV and trafficking must therefore address the differences in institutional capacity already in place. With regard to trafficking, the development of a more strategic approach to the problem would help to ensure that many of the priorities identified above are addressed.

Key steps would include:

**National Policy Development**

1. Development of a strategic framework to address trafficking in Mongolia based on the National Plan of Action, but with clear prioritisation of activities and mechanisms to measure impact.

2. Mapping of existing and planned activities against this framework.

3. Establishment of a dedicated focal point on human trafficking, which would include an information clearing-house role. This would involve activities such as an email list-serve with information on upcoming events such as training.
workshops, ensure the above mapping was updated on a regular basis, and possibly reviving and maintaining the information website developed by MFA.

4. Assisting the Mongolian government and other actors to identify and access high quality specialist anti-trafficking expertise as required.

International Cooperation

1. Facilitation of cooperation between Mongolia and China on a range of levels.
2. Exposure of Mongolian officials to examples of successful practice elsewhere (in a systematic rather than ad hoc way).

On-the-ground activities

1. Continuation and expansion of existing programmes to increase awareness and understanding of trafficking and related issues, particularly using interactive techniques such as peer education.
2. Ongoing monitoring of the situation and the impact of awareness-raising and other activities against established baselines.

Law Enforcement

As noted above, the most glaring aspect of Mongolia’s response to trafficking is a lack of progress on law enforcement. Although the Ministry of Justice is enthusiastic in its response to this problem, efforts are currently piecemeal with no apparent long-term strategy. The key steps that need to be taken on this issue include:

1. Strengthening of the legal framework around trafficking.
2. Development of specialist investigation expertise on trafficking.
3. Continuation of basic training on trafficking for front-line officials (police, border guards).
4. Training for prosecutors and judges.
5. Strengthened cooperation on law enforcement/prosecution between all concerned parties in Mongolia.
6. Strengthened international cooperation, particularly with China.

Many of these require specialist technical expertise, some of which is in relatively short supply, which would need to be kept in mind in developing a project in this area.

How these priorities fit with ADB’s areas of focus is perhaps something that would need further discussion, noting that ADB is involved in supporting projects in areas such as governance and legal development.

Phil Marshall

Anti-Trafficking Consultant

June 2007
Annex E: TCR